Section III
Cultural Anthropology

12

STATUS IMAGERY OF THE KALASHA: SOME NOTES ON CULTURE CHANGE

*Max Klimburg**

The Kalash or Kalasha, widely known also as the 'Kafirs of Pakistan' ('Heathens of Pakistan'), but presently numbering hardly more than 1500, present the unique issue of a survival of polytheistic-animistic belief systems amidst Islamic, that is intensely anti-'paganistic' monotheistically orientated communities. This fact is well-known, of course, and for many decades it has attracted scores of visitors into the three valleys the Kalasha inhabit in southern Chitral. Many researchers were among them, such as the famous Indologist Georg Morgenstierne, who heads the list due to his field work in 1929. He was followed nineteen years later by the religious ethnologist Halfdan Siiger,[1] and then by many others, most remarkably by the anthropologist Peter Parkes, who offers by far the best and most detailed insights into the Kalasha socio-economic and religious setup in the 1970s (unfortunately mostly in unpublished manuscripts). Scores of more visitors and researchers are bound to descend on the Kalasha with the view to experience an 'exotic' looking culture or to collect information on topics already studied or not. There are also many new interesting issues, resulting from the mounting impact of modernization (political, mechanical, medical, etc.), tourism, and Islamic proselytization, constituting the greatest culture change ever for Kalasha Kafir society.

The far-reaching culture change of today has a remarkable forerunner. It was the result of a gradual or sudden increase in the political and cultural relations between the Kalasha and their much more powerful neighbours to the west, the Kati Kafirs of the Bashgal valley in easternmost Afghanistan, the most dominant group of the once famous Kafirs of the Hindu Kush.[2] These contacts then intensified when leading Kati families left the Bashgal valley and settled in Kalasha territory, fleeing from the Afghan military force which in 1896 Islamized by force all the 'Afghan' Kafirs (then renamed Nuristanis). When, in the early 1930s, the last of these new settlers gave up their old beliefs and became Muslims, the Kalasha were 'left alone' hanging on to their Kafir beliefs and traditions.

These Kalasha traditions include a variety of beliefs and customs of apparent Kati origin which thus survive the demise of the Kati Kafir culture in a Kalasha context. By far the most impressive feature among them is presented by the monumental wooden ancestor images, *gaṇḍāo*, and smaller images on top of 'triumphal pillars,' the *guṇḍurīk*—both types resembling corresponding figures of the Kati Kafirs. Generally depicting a standing male person, occasionally a sitting one, rarely a man on horseback, these very numerous *gaṇḍāo* and few *guṇḍurīk* represented dead big-men who had built up their reputation with politicking combined with extensive feast-giving, occasionally also with some homicidal deeds. The *gaṇḍāo* stood next to or in the vicinity of the graves of the respective men. In the 1930s they counted many

* Stadiongasse, 6–8, Vienna, Austria.

dozens, maybe even close to one hundred, in the three Kalasha valleys, but by the early 1970s only a few of them were left.[3]

There is, thus, the aspect of a strong influence exerted by the Kati Kafirs, in particular by those living in the upper part of the Bashgal valley. Characteristically, their main local settlement, Bragromatal, is still well-known among the Kalasha under the name Gonagrom or Large Village, denoting its importance for the Kalasha by the reference to its size. Beyond this, all the Kati Kafir ethnic and political entities deserved the adjective 'large' and also 'strong' relative to the small and weak Kalasha communities, who, through the centuries, suffered badly under the frequent Kati raids into their territory.

The Kalasha themselves readily admit that many, partially even most of their religious and socio-cultural features and institutions are derived from Kati traditions. All this is well-known, as already pointed out by Peter Parkes, with reference to the Kalasha feasts of merit: 'The whole corpus of Kalasha festal institutions shares many traits in common with those reported of their Kafir neighbours, and several feasts appear to have been consciously adopted from those witnessed by Kalasha ancestors in Bashgal.'[4]

All this information begs the question as to when this cultural dependence of the Kalasha on the Kati materialized. Was it due to influences which gradually grew or rather to a sudden cultural impact at some time in the past?[5]

Apparently it was due to a rather sudden rise, around 1850, in the Kalasha interest in prestigious looking Kati customs. This led to a number of major socio-cultural innovations which are now regarded as typically Kalasha—such as the *gaṇḍāo/guṇḍurīk* tradition. Accordingly, a wide-ranging culture change took place within several decades, establishing new cultural features which since then have assisted the Kalasha in maintaining much more strongely than before an 'ethnic' identity of their own, in spite of all the 'adorning with borrowed plumes.'

In this context one Kalasha big-man stands out in particular. Mahadin from the Dremese lineage in Ramboor is credited with being the main initiator of a series of new forms of feasting which were all copied from the Kati Kafirs. Around 1850 he managed, possibly as the first Kalasha, to establish affinal ties to the powerful Janadare lineage in Bragromatal by arranging a marriage between his son Mehtarzang and a girl from that lineage. Mahadin then felt entitled, so the story goes, to perform feasts imitating in scope and execution the so-called *mü* of the Kati Kafirs. Accordingly, the Kalasha equivalent, called *biramūr* (death of he-goats), was performed by Mahadin for the first time. Thus, Mahadin appears as the first Kalasha headman who developed the idea of entertaining his community with feasts and presenting it also with goats (a standard feature on the occasion of a *biramūr*).

Mahadin reportedly also erected the first ancestor figure, a *gaṇḍāo*, in Ramboor for his father Dremes, thereby copying the Kati tradition of *mute* figures. He felt free to do so because of his good relations with the leading families among the Kati of Bragromatal. When soon afterwards Kalakan, an important man from the Gilasur-dari lineage in Gurul (Birir Valley), also wanted to erect a *gaṇḍāo* for his father, Manur, he had to travel to Chatrumadesh (the Kalasha term for present Nuristan) to find out about the local customs and to secure the Kati Kafirs' support. After having worked there as a shepherd for several years, so the story goes, he returned to Birir carrying a small figure which then served as a prototype for the first *gaṇḍāo* in Birir.

The contacts between the Kati and the Kalasha must have intensified when in the 1880s Aman-ul-Mulk, the then *mehtar* (king or prince) of Chitral, possibly on the advice of the British, invited a number of Kati families to move into the upper end of the Bumboret valley and to settle there on land given to them.[6] The idea was that these families would provide a

buffer between the powerful and agressive Kati and the Kalasha who suffered constantly from Kati goat-raiding.

From that time onwards the interest of the Kalasha in copying more from their neighbours apparently increased further. A good example is given by the story of the Ramboor big-man Amir, who, possibly at about 1890, still at the time of Mehtar Aman-ul-Mulk, travelled to Bragromatal as the *mehtar's ṣarwēlu*, that is, tax collector. Allegedly he succeeded in bringing 180 cattle across the mountains to be presented to the *mehtar*. While attending a funeral feast in Bragromatal, he observed the distribution of liquid *ghee* (clarified butter) in the form of one large ladleful given to each person, and the mixing of *ghee* with porridge made of gravy and millet. Much impressed, he advised his five sons, when back in Ramboor, to do the same on the occasion of the funeral feast in his honour. From that time onwards it is a Kalasha tradition at funerals and certain feasts of merit to both distribute *ghee* and to mix *ghee* with porridge made of gravy and millet, nowadays wheat flour—a mixture still called by the Kati term *bujush-anau*, while normally the Kalasha use their own words *ka'i* for the gravy-millet (nowadays gravy–wheat flour) porridge and *prochona* for *ghee*.

The Kati influence probably reached its climax when in early 1896 many Kati families, in particular the leading ones from Bragromatal, fled from the troops of Afghan Amir Abdur Rahman into Chitral. Most of them settled at the end of the two valleys Ramboor and Bumboret. Members of the top lineage of Bragromatal installed themselves in Brumbutul in Bumboret, while a rival lineage founded the village of Kuneisht in Ramboor. At least initially, the Kalasha felt not too uncomfortable about it, as they hoped for an expansion of the buffer, better protecting them against Kati raids across the border.

In due course the Kalasha developed further activities in the field of prestige and mortuary feasting which are copies of Kati traditions and also often carry Kati names, such as *pimasa*, *gontwas*, *tushgum*, *arisu*, *ulpa,* and so on. The most impressive introduction was the *sharuga*, a funeral feast requiring extensive hosting and the distribution of either thirty or sixty cattle, depending on the wish for an impressive single- or double-horse 'mounted *gaṇḍāo*' to represent the dead big-man. The feast's name is a Kati term, which was never changed into a Kalasha equivalent, which would be *sharugak*.

Also in the field of merit feasts, exemplified mainly by the *biramūr* introduced several decades earlier, a further increase took place by the copying of a very costly Kati feast given the Kalasha term *hazār-pai-pachek-gona-biramūr*. This particularly *gona* or 'large' *biramur* requires, as the title says, the 'showing and counting of *hazar* average goats' before the feast could start, but the term *hazar* does not correspond to the *hazar* known as the word for 'thousand' in Persian, Chitrali, or Kalashamon (the Kalasha language), as it is the Kati term *hazar* denoting 'four hundred.' Accordingly, this type of *biramūr* feast starts with the presentation of four hundred average goats or their equivalents in value, followed by extensive goat sacrifices at the Sajigor cult place in Ramboor and the distribution of many large he-goats to the community.

The first such *hazār-pai-pachek-gona-biramūr* was reportedly performed in honour of Mahamurat (Dremese lineage), the *asakāl* (*mehtar's* valley headman) of Ramboor, possibly already before the crucial year 1896. This feast then also entitled Mahamurat's family to perform in the big-man's name the greatest of all honours known to the Kati, namely the *sharuga* distribution of cattle on the occasion of the funeral feast, and the subsequent erection of a special, monumental *gaṇḍāo*, representing the dead big-man on horseback. However, when Mahamurat, probably already an old man when the Kati refugees moved in, appeared unlikely to live much longer, and an illness threatened to kill most of the family's livestock, it was decided to honour the great man by a small *sharuga* given during his lifetime, with ten

cows distributed on the occasion. This feast became known as a *juno-sharuga*, meaning an 'alive-*sharuga*', but it is the only one of this kind. As the feared illness did not materialize, the herds were complete when the great Mahamurat finally died, a year or so later, possibly in around 1900. Understandably, the mourning lineage wanted to save on the planned 'double' *sharuga* by reducing the number of cows (sixty) to fifty, as ten had already been distributed. However, Shishgumera, the chief of Kuneisht, the settlement of Kati refugees in Ramboor, protested, disqualifying the preceding ten cows and insisting that sixty animals had to be given away if there was any chance of the participation of his people at the feast. The Ramboor family had to give in. It was then fully entitled in Kati eyes to erect a monumental *gaṇḍāo* showing Mahamurat sitting not only on one horse, but on a pair of horses. This figure was the first 'mounted *gaṇḍāo*' among the Kalasha, out of the eventual total of six.

When, soon after, Shishgumera died, the Ramboor people threatened not to attend the funeral feast because of Shishgumera's unfair demand shortly before. The Kati village then sent a present of five cattle, as a token of good will, to the family of Mahamurat, and Ramboor decided to attend the funeral. A Kati *sharuga* was performed, and in the following autumn a mounted ancestor figure, called *mute* by the Kati, was erected—the only one ever made in the village of Kuneisht, featuring only one horse (no double horse *mute* is known from any Kati area).

In essence, the two *sharuga* given in honour of Mahamurat and Shishgumera may have been very similiar in type and execution—in both cases sixty cattle were distributed to the community. However, the *gaṇḍāo* made for Mahamurat shows him mounted on a pair of horses, as this was done for top Kati dignitaries in the Bashgal valley. This statue was placed in an enclosure containing also his and his wife's graves. Later two standing *gaṇḍāo*, representing his two leading sons Mahatomar and Surchai, were placed next to the mounted figure.[7]

A second double *sharuga* was performed in Ramboor at the funeral of Achayak (Mutimire lineage) some ten to fifteen years later, possibly in about 1910–15, therewith obtaining the right to have the dead big-man honoured by a double-horse *gaṇḍāo*, such as Mahamurat is depicted.[8] With these top honours bestowed on Achayak, the Mutimire lineage signalled its readiness to fight for more influence against the then leading Dremese lineage, and a factional struggle then started which has not yet ended. This fight reached a climax at the time of partition, when the Mutimire members held on to the *mehtar* and were against the creation of Pakistan, while the Dremese supported the Muslim League.

In Ramboor, a total of three more *sharuga* feasts were given, all of the smaller kind with 'only' thirty cattle distributed, each entitling to a mounted *gaṇḍāo* featuring a single horse. The last such feast occurred in the 1930s.[9] Strangely, in Bumboret and Birir no *sharuga* was ever performed, possibly due to a lack of political cohesion or sufficient surplus or, with regard to Birir, the 'offside' location of the valley, being much less exposed to direct contacts with the Kati. Nevertheless, in Birir one mounted *gaṇḍāo* existed in Biau, made a few years after Mahamurat's death for a big-man by the name of Lachkom (Punjapaudari lineage).

All the *sharuga* the Kalasha know of were thus performed after the flight of Kati Kafirs from the Bashgal valley into Chitral in 1896, and in context with these feasts, all the mounted *gaṇḍāo* date from the period roughly between 1900 and the 1930s. At the same time the Kati tradition of erecting standing or sitting ancestor figures proliferated in the Kalasha area. These *gaṇḍāo* were made by men with only some knowledge of the art of carving, as the Kalasha lack a proper class of artisans. However, after the arrival of the Kati refugees in 1896, the Kalasha had the opportunity to employ the enslaved skilled craftsmen, called *bari*, the Kati had brought with them. All the horse *gaṇḍāo* and some of the standing figures were

made by Kati *bāri*. Soon after the time of partition the interest in erecting *gaṇḍāo* greatly vanished, probably partially due to the creation of Pakistan as an Islamic state.[10]

One wonders, naturally, what the socio-political systems and traditions of the Kalasha may have looked like in the more distant past—before the Kati exerted their cultural domination, before the Kalasha copied the *mü* and *mute* and other traditions of their feared and then suddenly close neighbours, whose inclination to raid and kill had constituted a permanent threat to the Kalasha for many centuries. One wonders even more as to the reasons which had both induced and enabled the Kalasha to introduce such new and costly features into their socio-political life—features which required the saving of considerable surplus in animals and food items for the feasting and the distributions of food and live animals. One wonders, specifically, why the costliest undertakings took place only in Ramboor, why this valley's headmen developed such a singular drive for achievement, and how the affected families managed to collect the needed amount of surplus.

Answers have to remain speculative, in particular until Peter Parkes' extensive study of the Kalasha oral historical traditions is known.[11] One can assume, however, that the main reason must have been the wish, in particular of the Ramboor headmen, to impress the rulers in Chitral or their princely rivals with their wealth and authority and their competence in executing the rulers' often very oppressive demands (as to forced labour and enslavement), above all when directed at rivals. A further reason may well have been the desire to compete with or even outdo the high-powered newcomers from the Bashgal valley by adjusting to the Kati Kafirs' terms, but adding a new 'dimension' with the double-horse *gaṇḍāo*. A third aspect may be the impact resulting from the mounting political and also academic interest of the British in the area, counterbalancing somewhat the centuries-old negative attitude of the Muslim communities against the 'heathens' in their midst.

A stunning change in the (presently egalitarian) Kalasha socio-cultural setup thus appears to have taken place in the period between roughly 1850 and 1910, leading to the introduction of feasts and status symbols from the more stratified societies of the Kati Kafirs. Earlier, the Kalasha political structure may well have been rather that of stratified chiefdom societies, with a few families ruling like feudal chiefs, at the grace of the *mehtars* in Chitral, over poor and oppressed, powerless subjects. Then rival families or lineages may have started to invest in increasing their prestige, *namus*, and for establishing themselves as social groups to be reckoned with in competition with the Kati Kafirs and also vis-à-vis the *mehtars*, who, intermittently, also showed some interest in the Kalasha politically, that is, beyond the Kalasha potential source of slaves and forced labourers. When men like Amir were appointed as tax collectors in the Bashgal valley, new important sources of income opened up. Thus, new energies suddenly emerged, and members of well-to-do families started to build up their *namus* by organizing large feasts and erecting figures of their dead, the *gaṇḍāo*, then unknown (or lost?) in the Kalasha traditions. This new readiness to spend a fortune in the fight for status and power can only be explained by new sources of income and authority, and new forms of socio-political competition. Assumedly, the Kalasha headmen were also driven to compete with the Kati Kafirs, thereby enhancing their own status vis-à-vis their own people and the rulers of Chitral as well as a new dominant force in the area, the British. In addition, they may have felt the need to establish themselves more firmly in view of their much more exposed position after the Islamization of the Afghan Kafiristan in 1896. Basically, however, the Kalasha were probably affected by the far-reaching changes of the times, when Britain's 'great game' amd 'forward policy' against the Russians advancing in Central Asia made itself felt even in the princely state (or 'petty kingdom') of Chitral, deeply hidden in the mountains of the Hindu Kush.

NOTES

1. Presently his findings, complemented by contributions by Svend Castenfeldt, Mytte Fentz, and the author, are being prepared for publication under the title *The Old Kalash Society*.
2. The author's study on the art and culture of the Waigal and Ashkun Kafirs will be published by Franz Steiner Verlag, Stuttgart, in the spring of 1997. A second part, dealing with the Kati and Prasun Kafirs, is in the planning stage.
3. They fell prey to Western collectors and, much less so, to Muslim iconoclasts. When the author visited the Kalasha in November 1973, there were still some ten old and not-too-old *gaṇḍāo* in Ramboor, while in Bumboret only two new ones were present. He did not visit Birir, the third of the three valleys inhabited by the Kalasha. In 1996 six more-or-less new *gaṇḍāo* existed, i.e., one in Ramboor, two in Gurul (Birir), and three, partially buried in a flood-affected area, in Biau (Birir).
4. 'Alliance and Elopement. Economy, Social Order and Sexual Antagonism among the Kalasha (Kalash Kafirs) of Chitral, (D.Phil. thesis, Oxford, 1983), p. 497.
5. This was one of the author's research topics during his stay among the Kalasha in July–September 1996, made possible by a grant from the Austrian Science Fund. It was his second fieldwork in the area after his brief visit, mainly to Ramboor, in November–December 1973.
6. It is very likely that the two stunning photographs of Kafirs taken by B.E.M. Gurdon in 1895 and published in L. Edelberg and Schuyler Jones, *Nuristan* (Graz 1979), plates 24–25, relate to this newly established Kati Kafir settlement in Bumboret.
7. In 1972 Mahamurat's figure was purchased and exported to Italy. Later it was brought to the United States, from where it returned to Europe and entered the collection of the Museum of Anthropology in Munich. At some time during or even before its odyssey the figure lost its two horse heads.
8. The figure forms part of the collection of the museum in Peshawar.
9. When the presently last *hazār-pai-pachek-gona-biramūr* was staged in 1977 by a big-man in Ramboor who consistently tried to impress on the whole valley his dominant role of leadership, a *sharuga* was more or less expected when the big-man's father died a few years later. It did not materialize. The high costs of the *biramūr* (seventy-eight large he-goats, one ox, many smaller goats, etc.) must have reduced the interest in more undertakings of such tremendous costs. This *biramūr* may well have been the last one forever of the particular large kind, as nowadays other priorities are gaining the upper hand.
10. In 1980 the first and last *gaṇḍāo* since the 1950s was erected in Ramboor. The figure was still standing in the local cemetery in August 1996.
11. See his paper, 'A Minority Perspective on the History of Chitral: Katore Rule in Kalasha Tradition,' in this volume.

13

NO PEOPLE ARE AN ISLAND

*Birgitte Glavind Sperber**

In this study I will try in brief to analyse how the Kalash,[1] through history, socially as well as culturally, have actively responded to different situations and to the impact from the outside world. I will discuss whether globalization is only a recent phenomenon or whether the actual term can also be applied to the past. Emphasizing on the modern situation, I will attempt an analysis of the surrounding world's interests in the Kalash. In this context I will discuss how conflicting views of what 'Kalasha culture' actually means lead to different views on development.

Part of the discussion will be based on the following case from among the Kalash. During our first stay in the Kalasha valleys we easily learned to distinguish Muslim houses from Kalasha houses—the women's dresses of course were striking. It was also obvious, though, that if there were chickens around a house it was not a Kalasha house. We soon learned the myth explaining why the Kalasha religion objects to chicken.[2] We learned about the *Bashali* system—a basic element of the religion: women in the state of menstruation and delivery are most impure and so have to be confined to protect the community from defilement. During Chaomos in 1983 the *Bashali* women complained to me that they could not take part in the festivities—it was obvious that everybody obeyed the rules. During the later years I saw chickens gradually being taken into some of the Kalasha households. I also heard that some of the women began taking the *Bashali* rules less seriously. During the latest years people worried very much because of a serious disease among the goats which causes problems for the production of milk and cheese. When I came back this summer there were no chickens in the village.

Washlim Gul said to me:

> In May all the fifteen *quasis*[3] from all three valleys gathered. First they went to Birir, then they went to Bumboret, and then they came here to Ramboor. They told the people that if we didn't stop keeping chickens, it would be the end of the Kalash. The very same night the fox came and ate all my eight chickens. The men killed it with sticks—you can see the skin hanging there in the veranda. I blame the *quasis*—I could have sold my chickens for 800 rupees.

Quasi Khrosh Nawaz said to me:

> All we *quasis* gathered because of the problems with the goats: we realized why, and then we explained to the people: The goats are dying because you don't observe the customs: some families keep chickens. Some women do not go to the Bashali when they have to, and some men pray without wearing a hat! Now again everybody is following the custom, and soon the goats will be better!

Goats are essential in the Kalasha religion and life, and the condition of the goats, therefore, was perceived as a symptom of the state of the community. Were the goats dying due to what Peter Parkes (1990a) has called 'cultural slackness' in his description of a similar incident in 1975? Those days a shaman told the people why and what to do.

* Tangevej 31, 6760 Ribe, Denmark.

Were the religious heads, in other words, once again stabilizing the customs from the inside?

Can the classical anthropological tradition of analysing the so-called 'other' like 'islands' in this case be applied to the Kalash, or should the case rather be seen as an active response to the fact that the Kalash are part of a local and a national, as well as a global, world and have been so through history?

In anthropology *tribal societies* have been analysed as isolated units and their entity as a 'mosaic of cultures.'[4]

Even though *systemic views* came in with Barth's (1956) classical analysis of ecological interactions between groups in Swat—'traditional' societies like the Kalash have also often been ascribed a static culture and static time (Fabian 1983), that is, being 'without history' (Wolf 1982). Has the Kalasha culture ever been static?[5] Historic-economic factors were taken into consideration, when the world system analysts (Amin 1976; Giddens et al. 1985; Wallerstein 1990) incorporated individual communities into a global entity, but there were still problems when accounting for 'culture.'[6]

Most recently, the consequences of the present global flux of information, values, people, and cultural elements of all kinds have been included in the world system analysis (Hannerz 1987, 1992; Appadurai 1990; Giddens 1990; Foster 1991; Friedman 1992, 1993; Lash & Urry 1993). The possible consequences of the so-called 'globalization' are subject to a current debate in anthropology:

- ❒ Will globalization lead to uniformization: in other words will everybody in due time in 'the global village'[7] be wearing blue jeans, while watching global TV on their Sony and drinking Coke?
- ❒ Is something new created when people living in 'the global ecumene' (Foster 1991; Hannerz 1992) are exposed to the elements of the global flux, making choices and incorporating elements—often in a new way, giving them new significance—'Creolization' (Hannerz 1989)?
- ❒ Or, using the nationalism-ethnicity-discourse, does exposure to globalization and contact with other values lead to a greater awareness of one's own values leading to establishment of cultural or ethnic boundaries (Barth 1971)?

These questions, I think, can never be answered categorically in any area. They can just serve as analytical tools.

History is positional—that is, the past is often reshaped into a version which fits the needs of the present (Hobsbawm 1983)—also sometimes the needs of outsiders. This is possible in particular when the past is scarcely documented.

Where the Kalash initially came from will probably forever be veiled in mists (for discussions see, e.g., Loude & Lièvre 1984). Did the Kalash, as their oral tradition tells, come from 'Tsiam'—their mythical ancestral country said to be near Yarkand, where people nowadays look and speak so totally differently, since the area came under Chinese domination?

Does this fit into the linguistic theories (Morgenstierne 1973; Bashir 1988) about Aryan migrations from Central Asia with the Dardic speakers as an ancient side branch?

Did the Kalash, as their oral tradition also tells (Saifullah Jan 1990), descend from Alexander the Great's brave general Shalak Shah from Tsiam, whom Alexander gave the Chitral valley as a reward? This myth at least is essential for the romantic image promoted by the tourist industry of the fair-skinned, often blond, and blue-eyed people living a pagan Dionysian life in a country flowing with wine and honey. Promotion of this myth may be

responsible for the strong attraction the valleys exert on tourists from other parts of the country. This version of the past might also be the reason why Greek scholars and developers are attracted to the valleys—it seems to be part of the 'search for roots' that for many people is a response to modernity.

Do the Kalash have linguistic ties to the old Palestine as suggested by a linguist at the previous conference in Chitral? Or is this just another 'search for roots' theory—maybe meant to legitimize the conversion Christian missionairies want so badly? The origin of the Kalash may be discussed forever.

Far less a matter of discussion seems to be that once, probably around the year 1500 (see, e.g., Parkes 1994) the Kalash were dominant in the entire region: the Kalasha oral tradition mentions eight great Kalasha kings—the last one was Rajawai in Bumboret who even fought victoriously in Nuristan. Local people often find remnants of buildings revealing the past way of life. Scientific studies of languages and other cultural traits give the evidence.[8]

After this period of domination, the Kalash gradually became subject to what might be termed a first wave of 'globalization' in terms of a 'global' flux of information, values, people, and cultural elements: Islam spread from its centre of origin gaining a foothold over most of the old world prior to the age of the European Renaissance and discoveries (Ahmed 1993).

Unlike the globalization processes of today, though, this spread lasted for centuries, as the speed of spread those days was determined by feet and not by electrons.

According to the Kalasha oral tradition, Islam in the Chitral region at first seems to have been embraced by kings who then converted their subordinates more or less forcibly. The most persistent of the Kalash took refuge from conversion in the less accessible side valleys like Ramboor.

As a result, Muslims became dominant in Chitral and the formerly dominant Kalash became marginalized—subjugated people bound to pay tributes to and perfrom corvée labour[23] (Parkes 1994; Baig 1994) for the *mehtars*, economically exploited by the tricks of their eastern neighbours (Baig 1994) and subject to frequent robbery raids from their western neighbours on the other side of the snowy peaks.

I have often wondered how this little group of people was able to survive culturally under such strong pressure from outside and why the social structure of the Kalash changed from what the Cacopardos[9] termed a 'father society' (hierarchy during the kingdom period) into a 'brother society' (egalitarian, or rather with several competing leaders).

I have also been wondering why purification rites are so crucial in the Kalasha religious system and practices.

Mary Douglas gives a kind of explanation in her analysis of 'enclave cultures,'[10] which Parkes (1994) was the first to use in a Kalasha context.

Small groups surrounded by strong enemies tend to make strategies which aim towards preventing defection and keeping the group as a unit. It is done through religous systems preoccupied with inner purity in regard to the surroundings and maintaining the world order by means of purification and comprehensive rites. A social demarcation *vis-à-vis* the surroundings, which are strong due to hierarchical social systems, makes the enclave egalitarian, which also means a constant preoccupation with rivalry and factionalism.

This summer, the Kalasha historical and cultural expert Khrosh Nawaz explained to me that the basic *ōmjesta/prāghata* dualism in the religion has been there from the very beginning. This seems plausible, as it is a very ancient way of structuralizing the world in pure/impure, we/them, and cosmos/chaos dualities.

Khrosh Nawaz also said that after the Kalash settled in Ramboor (and thus became an enclave due to marginalization), the purification rites increased, mainly ordered by the great shaman Nanga *dehār*—a confirmation of parts of Douglas's theory. Consequently the religious and social systems of the Kalash seem to be their active strategic responses to change due to impact from outside.

The next exposure to 'globalization' came in the last centuries when the British spread out their territories, people, ideologies and systems, which had an enduring impact everywhere. In this region, a visual remnant from the colonial period is the bagpipes and tartans of the Chitrali Scouts (an example of Creolization).

To the Kalash and other people in the region, the daily contact with the administrative, educational, and legal systems of British origin is a result of this process.

Crucial to the existence of the Kalash became the British Durand Line, which made the Kalasha valleys part of the Raj and so part of today's Pakistan. This prevented the Kalash from being forcibly converted like the Afghan parts of Kafiristan. It was in the British period, though, the Kalash had to accept that land in the upper parts of the Kalash valleys was given to refugees from Nuristan.

From about 1800, nationalism emerged as an ideology in Europe and spread with the colonial powers and the local educated elites like a global wave which still has a deep impact on the world of today (Smith 1989; Hylland Eriksen 1989; Anderson 1991; Foster 1991; Bourdieu 1992; Arnason 1993).

After the formation of Pakistan in 1947, this new state entered a stage of nation-building. Since then it has been a goal for the national government to forge into a unit the multitude of ethnic and religious groups as well as the multitude of environments in the country. The Father of the Nation, Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the national constitution,[11] the flag, and the national anthem are examples of national symbols of unity.

The tools for linking the territories are roads, domestic flights, the administrative and legal systems, the police, and the army.

The tool for joining the people is the creation of a national identity—directly through the educational system and the national mass media—both promoting Urdu as a common language. The Kalash respond differently to education. Carriers of the religious and oral tradition worry that education may lead to loss of the spiritual purity which is needed for keeping contact with the divine. Thus, Quasi Pali Azam explained to me: 'If people fill up their brains with books they lose their capacity for dream-seeing!' Other people have told me that they want some of their sons to stay out of school and remain as shepherds. This might be interpreted pragmatically, but also as a perceived need of pure minds for guarding the pure goats that are so essential in the Kalasha religion. Most people, though, appreciate that education has come. They consider it an expansion of possibilities—for income and in particular for influencing the community and its relations with the surrounding world by means of new insight and language skills. Education means contact—not only with knowledge but also with values.

Deeply rooted in the Kalasha tradition is that honour first of all is acquired through giving and sharing. Education may lead to change of values from communal concern into a preoccupation with personal gain—which leads to less respect inside the community.

A few individuals even use 'traditional attitudes' as a pretext above their changed values while charming contracts from donors from the outside.

In 1969, the Kalash became citizens in a nation state. Nation-building has facilitated the intrusion of influence and change from outside. The most direct impact on the Kalash has been the road construction. In general, roads have been accepted positively, along with the acceptance of hospitals and other services outside the valleys. Among the Kalash, though,

there is a great awareness and concern about the fact that the state also has big economic interests in the valleys which are facilitated by the roads. First of all there is the extraction of resources—for not only timber for the less forested areas, but also mineral prospecting. The Kalash want their legal share of the incomes from the resources and first of all direct influence on what and how much should be extracted from the valleys. The Kalash perceive this as a pressure from outside and have responded strategically with unity—even with the Muslim inhabitants in the valleys.

Roads also facilitate tourism,[12] which can be considered part of the modern globalization processes: tourism is a result of globalization, where 'globalized' people search for 'originality' and want to see what the global mass media talks about. At the same time, tourism is a major globalizing force, as it means contact and exchange between people (Urry 1988; MacDonald 1993).

Tourism on a big scale has to be controlled as it has the potential to destroy its objects. The Kalash are a major tourist object and so of great economic interest for the public and private tourist industries. This is mainly outside Kalasha ownership and control, which of course leads to concern and frustration among the Kalash—not unanimously, but depending on how much individuals are feeling harassed by, or are earning from the tourists. Tourism may be destructive, but on the other hand, it may also be a culture saving factor in encouraging cultural pride. This is obviously growing among the Kalash, however, mainly due to the activities of their own leaders.

The Kalasha culture has always responded to and evolved along with the surrounding world. To some interests, saving the culture means freezing it into a museum of the living past. I have heard influential people complaining that the Kalasha no longer wear hide straps around their feet but have got shoes. Twelve years ago actually most of the women walked bare-footed in the snow—I have also heard people complaining that stoves and electricity are replacing the romantic open fireplaces in the houses. For the Kalasha women these innovations actually mean fewer smoke-related eye diseases and, for example, a greater possibility of keeping the houses clean.

When outsiders complain and the Kalash do not, even though they are very concerned about keeping their own culture alive, it is because of different perceptions of what 'Kalasha culture' actually is. When asked what 'Kalasha culture' is, a Kalash may reply. '*homa dastur*!'—'our tradition'—in brief, mainly words and ways, determined by the Kalasha religion. This is not what matters to tourists. Most tourists come to see the 'culture'and catch it with their camera—an extra eye.' Thus, tourist interests emphasize the spectacular, the big communal rites and the material culture—dresses, houses, and technology—therefore, the complaints about material changes.

The communal rites are religious manifestations sustaining the world and the unity of the community. If someday these rites become reified as tourist objects (like now the dancing has been taken out of the religious context and is done for money), the basic functions of the rites might vanish along with the unity and the world they maintain.

An increasing dependence on tourist incomes influences the material culture—the women's dresses in particular: once the women become extra picturesque, the incomes increase, and once the incomes increase, money is used for extra decorations of the women.

The Kalasha women are very aware of their role as cultural symbols. This fact increases their pride but may also keep them 'traditional,' which later on might become an undesired strait jacket. Tourism means increased contact—also with other values, sometimes causing frustrations. Contact with Western women, for example, may mean contact with feminist ideas, which may cause the Kalasha women to change their frame of reference. In 1990 a

woman proudly said: 'We Kalasha women are very free: we can go to Birir and Bumboret, whereas the Muslim women have to wear the veil and stay in their houses' (Parkes 1990b). This summer she was very frustrated that her husband would not allow her to travel outside the valleys with foreign friends. Now she feels trapped between modernity and tradition, whereas her husband, due to his outside contacts, needs to take into consideration the norms of the surrounding world, where a local woman travelling freely around will be subject to great disrespect. It is no longer tourists alone who perceive capacity for travel as a symbol of freedom.

Democracy as an ideology can be considered part of globalization and has become a symbol of modernity. Sometimes, democracy emerges due to pressures from below, sometimes from above—frequently even from outside as a precondition for aid or political support on the global arena. Part of democracy is political parties and debate. To the Kalash this has become synonymous with politicians and conflicts: the quest for seats by outside politicians means an often aggressive quest for votes, which again has caused a deep disruption of the unity of the Kalasha community.

As the national elites and decision makers to a very high degree are turned outwards, they also use the global 'development ideology' as a tool in the nation-building process—this is often done uncritically. Development introduced from outside always means change. 'The developed,' though, do not always perceive development defined by outsiders as improved conditions of life (Sperber 1993): people may lose influence over their own situation and perhaps also their 'roots' during the development process and are at risk of reaching a 'point of no return.'

Above, I have given examples of globalizing elements and forces—all apparently homogenizing the cultures of the world, some of them disrupting the unity of small communities.

Are the Kalash heading towards a point of no return—is the Kalasha culture and community maybe at the edge of an abyss? That of course depends on factors in the outside world as well as on the inside.

The government should have an interest in sustaining and not destroying the potential[13] of tourist incomes: this demands attentive control of and influence over the tourist enterprises delegated to the Kalasha community. It also means education of the visitors—from this country too. Sustaining this economic potential should also be taken literally in the sense of sustaining resources—land, wood, pastureland—a strong economic argument in favour of the Kalasha struggle for their resources (Sperber 1992, 1995).

Some people might think that sustaining the Kalasha culture means that the valleys rather should be kept as a game reserve for researchers and maybe heavily paying tourists (Eidheim 1971).

Saifullah Jan has said to me, 'Man has been to the moon, then why should we be kept in darkness?' Of course, the Kalash do not want to be kept like wild animals.

They know about the outside world. They may not want to go to the moon, but they want development on their own conditions. Development, of course, means change, which has always occurred. Maybe the outside world should listen to how the Kalash define their own culture ('our tradition'), and forget worrying about material changes. 'When the kerosene lamp replaced the torches, did it then destroy our culture? So why should electricity?' (Saifullah Jan).

Reverting to the initial questions about the consequences of globalization and whether it is a threat to the Kalasha community and culture, one finds that it means contacts between values and ideas, but not necessarily amalgamation. In many places, contact has led to greater

awareness of one's own values, and even to a strengthening of these, like for instance when young daughters of Muslim immigrants in the West put on the veil. In the globalized world of today ethnic consciousness is increasing, and 'ethnic boundaries'[14] are frequently drawn anew. This is what happened in the case cited at the beginning of this study.

Like most of the Kalash, the religious heads are concerned about the tradition, which is what keeps the people united above political factionalism and daily petty conflicts—the communal rites like festivals and funerals in particular serve as uniting forces and should not be reified into tourist objects.

Chickens to be sold to tourists for money, as well as new ideas, like that going to *Bashali* is oppression of the women, were obviously interpreted as harmful intrusions from outside which might lead to a gradual cultural decay. The goats are fine indicators and gave the evidence that something was wrong. The *quasis* gave their advice, and apparently everybody obeyed. They did so as in the Kalasha religion the individuals share the responsibility for the entire community because individual religious offence may lead to communal disaster.

So, beside the basic resources, the religious tradition is imperative for the survival of the Kalasha community.

At present, the Kalash know this very well. They even strengthen the tradition from inside—a kind of ethnic boundary making—as shown in the example. Through their outward activities and also internally through their culture, the Kalash respond actively to the impact from the outside world as they have always done. The Kalash are not victims of globalization, but active actors on the national and global stage.

NOTES

1. I have asked Saifullah Jan whether to say Kalash or Kalasha. He said that the name is Kalash, but when used as an adjective it should be Kalasha.
2. Khrosh Nawaz (1983) described the mytn thus:

   once, when all the people in Chitral were Kalash, there was no place for Mahandeo in Jumur. There was a woman shaman. She was the daughter of Shai, and her name was Mali. She ordered the people in Jumur to level a flat place. When they had done so, she asked them to bring a pot of milk, a pot of wine, a pot of *ghee*, and seven handfuls of wheat to the place. When they had done this and everybody was gathered there, she entered into a trance—she walked around on the flat place they had made—and suddenly a carved piece of wood appeared upon her head. It just came down from the sky. Then she said: this place is Mahandeo. He has come here now; but in three years a new living thing is going to appear on this place. After that the Muslims will come—the new thing is going to bring Islam here. After having said so, the woman shaman died, and they buried her. After this incident people were anxious to see which new thing was going to appear—they did not know what Islam was. After the three years a chicken appeared, and after that the Muslims arrived, and the people of Jumur began to pray like them and became Muslims. That is why we Kalash do not want to keep the chicken.
3. A *quasi* is the religious expert of a Kalasha village.
4. The 'Mosaic Stereotype,' R. Keesing 1975: 111.
5. In my paper from the Hindu Kush conference in 1990 I documented how the traditional is not at all static with the Kalasha dresses, beads, etc., as examples.
6. In this context I abstain from defining 'culture.'
7. The expression was invented by MacLuhan.
8. Augusto and Alberto Cacopardo are working on these subjects.
9. At the Conference for Kalasha researchers held in Aarhus, Denmark, in April 1993.
10. Mary Douglas 1993, which Peter Parkes kindly borrowed for me: based on the period the ancient Jews spent 'in the wilderness'(described in The Book of Numbers in the Bible) Douglas makes a general theory about which strategies small enclave groups surrounded by strong forces will choose to survive.
11. Although Islam was the reason for the formation of Pakistan, the non-Islamic minorities of the country (for example the Kalash) have the constitutional rights to practice their beliefs.

12. The roads may even be there more because of the tourists than because of the local people: if the road to the major tourist target Bumboret breaks due to a flood, it is repaired in a few days. When the road to Ramboor broke in 1991, the repair took three years' work.
13. According to the former deputy commissioner of Chitral in Parkes (1990b).
14. See Barth 1971 and Hylland Eriksen 1989 for a general survey on the ethnicity discussion.

References

Ahmed, Akbar S. 1993. *Living Islam From Samarkand to Stornoway*. BBC Books.

Amin, Samir. 1976 The Third World and the New Economic Order. *Cultures* (3) 4: pp. 58–65.

Anderson, Benedict. 1991 Intrdouction and chap. 1. In *Imagined Communities*: *Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism*, 2nd edition, London. pp. 1-36.

Appadurai, Arjun. 1990 Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy. In *Global Culture, Nationalism, Globalization and Modernity*, ed. M. Featherstone, pp. 295–310. London: SAGE Publications.

Arnason, Johan P. 1993, Nationalism, Globalization and Modernity. In M. Featherstone, (ed.), *Global Culture*, pp. 207–36.

Baig, Rahmat Karim. 1994 *Hindu Kush Study Series*. Vol. 1. Peshawar. Rehmat Printing Press.

Barth, Fredrik. 1956 Ecologic Relations of Ethnic Groups in Swat, North Pakistan. *American Anthropologist*, vol. 58 pp. 1079–89.

_____, 1971. Introduction. *Ethnic Groups and Boundaries*, ed. F Barth, pp. 11–38. Berenn: Universitets forlaget.

Bashir, Elena. 1988 *Topics in Kalasha Syntax: An Areal and Typological Perspective*. University of Michigan Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1992 Identity and Representation: Elements for a Critical Reflection on regions. In *Language and Symbolic Power* ed. John B. Thompson, pp. 229–51. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Douglas, M. 1993 *In the Wilderness: The Doctrine of Defilement in the Book of Numbers*. Editor: Give city of publication Sheffield Academic Press.

Eidheim, Harald. 1971 When Ethnic Identity is a Social Stigma. In Barth F. (ed), *Ethnic Groups*, pp. 39–57.

Fabian, Johannes, 1983 Time and Tense In *Time and the Other*, pp. 80–97. New York: Columbia University Press.

Foster, Robert J. 1991 Making National Cultures in the Global Ecumene. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, vol. 20: pp. 235–60.

Fox, Richard G., ed. 1990 Introduction. *Nationalist Ideologies and the Production of National Cultures*, ed. R. G. Fox, pp. 1–15. Washington, D.C.

Friedman, Jonathan 1992 Narcisism, Roots and Postmodernity: The Constitution of Selfhood in the Global Crisis. In ed. Scott Lash *Modernity and Identity*, and J. Friedman, pp. 331–66. London:

_____, 1993, Being in the World: Globalization and Localization. In Featherstone, M. (ed.), *Global Culture*, pp. 311–28.

Giddens, Anthony 1985, 'Nation States in the Global State System'. I: *The Nation State and Violence*, Cambridge: Polity Press. pp. 255-293 (Chap. 10).

Giddens, Anthony. 1990 *The Consequences of Modernity*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hannerz, Ulf. 1989 The World in Creolisation. *Africa*, vol. 57, no 4 pp. 546–59.

_____, 1992, *Cultural Complexity*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Hylland Eriksen, T. 1993 *Ethnicity & Nationalism Anthropological Perspectives*. London.

Keesing, Roger M. 1981 *Cultural Anthropology, A Contemporary Perspective* Holt, Rinehart & Winston.

Lash, S., & John Urry. 1994a. Conclusion. In *Economies of Signs and Space*, pp. 314–26.

_____, 1994b. Economies f Objects and Subjects. In *Economies of Signs and Space*, pp. 12–58.

_____, 1994c. Globalization and Modernity. In *Economies of Signs and Space*, pp. 252–313.

_____, 1994d. Introduction. In *Economies of Signs and Space*, pp. 1–11.

Loude, Jean-Yves, & Viviane Lièvre 1984. *Solstice paien*. Paris: Presses de la Renaissance. Reprinted in English as *Kalash Solstice*, Pakistan: Lok Virsa.

MacDonald, Sharon. 1993 Identity Complexes in Western Europe: Social Anthropological Perspectives. In *Inside European Identities*, ed. Sharon MacDonald, p. 1–26. Oxfor: Berg.

Morgenstierne, Georg. 1973 *The Kalasha Language*. Oslo: Institutet for Sammenlignende Kulturforskning, Universitetsforlaget.

Parkes, P. 1990a Kalasha Rites of Spring. Backstage of a 'Disappearing World' Film. *Anthropology Today*, Vol. 6(5): (Oct.): 11–13.

_____, 1990 The Kalasha: Rites of Spring. *Disappearing World*. Granada Television of England.

_____, 1994 Personal and Collective Identity in Kalasha Song Performance: The Significance of Music-Making in a Minority Enclave. In *Ethnicity, Identity and Music*, ed. Martin Stokes. Berg.

Saifullah Jan. 1996 Development and History of the Kalasha People. In *Proceedings of the Second International Hindu Kush Cultural Conference*, ed. E. Bashir and Israr-ud-Din Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Sperber, B. G. 1992 Nature in the Kalasha Perception of Life and Ecological Problems. *Nordic Proceedings in Asian Studies*, No 3. NIAS.

_____, 1993 Kalasha Development Problems. Unpublished paper from the Conference of European Kalasha Researchers, arranged by the Department of Ethnography and Social Anthropology, Aarhus University, Denmark, 23–25 Mar.

_____, 1995 Nature in the Kalasha Perception of Life. In *Asian Perceptions of Nature, A Critical Approach*, Ed. Ole Bruun and Arne Kalland. Curzon Press.

Sperber, Birgitte G.Kalash 1996, Dresses, Body decorations and Textile Techniques.' Paper from the Proceedings of Second International Hindu Kush Cultural Conference held in Chiltral 19-23.9. Oxford University Press, Karachi.

Urry, J. 1998 Cultural Change and Contemporary Holiday Making. *Theory, Culture and Sòciety*, vol 5: pp. 35–55.

Wallerstein, Immanuel. 1991 The Ideological Tensions of Capitalism. In *Race, Nation, Class. Ambiguous Identities*, ed. Etienne Balibar and I. Waallerstein, pp. 29–36. London: Verso.

Wolf, E.R. 1982. *Europe and the People without History*. London.

14

THE PHOENIX AND KHOWAR MUSIC

*Mohammad Irfan Irfan**

'Of the major arts, music may be the most ancient, because the urge to sing and dance in response to feelings of anger, joy, or sorrow springs from the body itself. Music may also be described as sound shaped by time.' In Kho culture, music has always been an important element. The Kho people, due to their special natural and cultural surroundings, have been able to develop their own music, which is thought to be one of the most ancient in these regions. Unfortunately, so far no scientific study of the musical art of this area has been carried out to find out its roots as well as its special characteristics.

The importance of music in these areas can be imagined from the fact that in the legends and myths of Central Asia and the subcontinent, a number of miracles are attributed to certain tunes of music. It is generally believed that music is food for the soul. Famous saints of the East introduced music in their spheres of influence to popularize the message of mysticism. Music also has its influence on animals like camels, horses, snakes, and deer. Emperor Jahangir used to hunt deer with the help of music. In the valley of the Hindu Kush and Karakoram love for music is very old and equally common. *Qoqnuz* is one of the finest tunes of Khowar music in these areas. The name of *qoqnuz* is actually borrowed from the local name of a bird called the phoenix, which is thought to dwell in the high mountains of Yasin and Yarkhun valleys of this region. As the legend goes, *qoqnuz* lived for 500 or more years then made a pyre of boughs to sit on and there produced melodious music. The mythical bird is thought to have 360 holes in its bill and through each hole it blows a separate note of music, the combined rythm of which makes the '*qoqnuz hang*' of the tune. When the phoenix reaches its musical climax, its tail catches fire and the boughs begin to burn. The bird goes on singing until it is consumed by the fire to become ashes. One day, from these ashes, the bird will be reborn, passing through the same cycle once again. During the so- called concert of the *qoqnuz*, when the whole valley is filled with its sweet melody, the musicians of the surrounding valleys of Chitral and Yasin gather and hide themselves in nearby caves or tree trunks to learn by heart the different melodies of the music produced by the *qoqnuz*, which they later play on their musical instruments to popularize them amongst the masses. However, it is popularly believed that each note coming out of each hole of the phoenix's bill makes a separate rhythm of Khowar music, and there are thus 360 such different tunes in Khowar, which are thought to have been derived from the original music of the phoenix. Now, for a long time the phoenix has not been seen nor heard but its tune is still played in different parts of the region.

The popular songs of Shinu Balit, and Burushaski are also composed on the musical tunes of the *qoqnuz*. There are several songs of Khowar composed from the tunes of Shina songs and there are Shina songs composed from the tunes of Khowar. Dances and musical instruments, that is, *sitar*, *daf*, flute, and drums of the region, are the same. A new addition, *jerikaen*, has been introduced as a musical instrument, replacing the *daf* during the past

* Treasury Office, Chitral.

twenty-five years, which, some argue, has lowered the standard of Khowar music. It is believed that the tunes of many Khowar songs have been derived basically from the '*qoqnuz*' melodies. During the last two or three decades, due to the exposure of the area to outside influences through the electronic media, certain changes in Khowar music have occured. For example, different modern music composers have adopted Urdu, Pashto, and English tunes for Khowar songs. Fortunately, these new experiments have not been successful with most of the music fans. The masses still generally prefer to listen to the old tunes derived from the *qoqnuz* or other traditional musical melodies.

Some people compare the original *qoqnuz* music to the well-known '*depak rag*' of Indian music, which enjoys the special attribute of inflaming candles and causing heat in the weather.

References

Anon. 1998a Music In Michael, D. Harkavy. (ed-in-chief), *The New Webster's International Encyclopedia.* Naples, Florida.

———. 1998b. Phoenix. In Michael, D. Harkavy (ed-in-chief), *The New Webster's International Encyclopedia.* Naples, Florida.

Biddulph, John. 1880 *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh.* Calcutta: Office of the Superintendent of Government Publishing.

Israr-ud-Din, Wazir Ali Shah, and Inayatullah FAizi. 1985b. *Chitral Ek Taarruf.* Chitral: Anjuman-e-Taraqqi Khuowar.

Israr-ud-Din. 1971. Khowar Adab. In *Tarikh Adbiyat-e-Maaribi Pakistan*, ed. Group Capt. Syed Fayaz Mehmud. Lahore.

Nigah, Maula. 1996. The Khowar Music. In *Proceedings of the second International Hindu Kush Cultural Conference,* ed. Elena Bashir and Israr-ud-Din. Karachi: Oxford University Press.

15

DON'T CRY MY DAUGHTER: LULLABIES AS A KEYHOLE INTO KALASHA CULTURE

*Wynne Maggi**

This study deals with a charming genre of women's folk songs, *'su'da ishpaDay'ak ghÖ,'* indigenous to the Kalash valleys. While there are as many styles and themes as there are women who compose these lullabies, these I especially like:

Shuar Begim's Grandmother's Song

Na'no tay nama'lo	Your auntie called you
wakshi' Shuar Begim	vain Shuar Begim
May hat'ya as'ta pruST e	To me, though, it's fine
ChuL'ikik as'ta pey haw	even if you are a daughter
May hat'ya ta pruST e	To me, though, it's fine
Juruk'ik as'ta pey haw	even if you're just a baby girl
Wa'wali baca' o	Your grandfather was a king
Tay mo'ali wazir'	Your mother's brother a ruler
Wa'wo shehe maw	Your grandfather said this:
i'a ta bokmacEk'	she's just worthless (kidding)
gol ne kar'im day, e	but I'm not paying attention
parwa' ne karim day	I'm not worried at all
tu'ku tu'ku i, e	hurry, hurry and come
janat' kaLaSagrom'	(to) heavenly Kalashagrom
Tay bistyak' rAnjen	behind you flocks of animals
kui'una pu'ri kay	fill the valley

Akbar Nawaz's Mother's Song for Her Granddaughter

Gambu'ri hardi'es krom	Flowers are the heart's work
May Gul Zarin' gamburi	My little Gul Zarin flower garden
	gher'ik-o
Awo gurzen'duna wor kar'im	Your grandmother is sitting in the
	garden, smelling [the flowers]
Chirik'as kay asam tay hat'ya	I've made it like milk for you
	[i.e., sweet and wonderful]

* Dept of Anthropology, Emory University, Atlanta, GA 30322.

TaLe'La chak kay asam tay hatya	There I've made shade for you
Du pu'ri kow Arapistan' asis	For two full years I was in Arabia
Arap' pay satir' matro' may Kay Hinduistan pruSt bacai', goi	I went to Arabia and the president said to me: India is a good kingdom, they say
Ne ta Hindu'es baca' manim day, Ne ta Ruses baca' manim day	I won't obey India's king Neither will I obey Russia's king
Hish kas ne mi-o tan wut kas dem	I'll never give my vote to anyone
Tara kursi'una nisim pay-e thrown	There I [myself] will sit on a throne
Ta dung la dung la dung lo Gul Zarin gambu'ri	Ta dung la dung la dung lo Gul Zarin flower

I have reproduced these songs with three purposes in mind. First, on a purely aesthetic basis, they are delightful, insightful, and fun. They are not written for personal glory or gain, but out of love and good humour as gifts for children and as a means of self-expression.

Second, while I first collected songs simply because the women seemed to like singing them for me, I quickly realized that they were more than 'just words'—that with this sometimes flip and silly and sometimes almost tragic genre, women consciously or unconsciously communicate their deepest cultural values to one another and to their children. Some of the best work in feminist anthropology recently has come out of folklore, out of careful attention to women's creative words. Lila Abu-Lughod (1986), Benedicte Grima (1991, 1992), Margaret Trawick (1990, 1991), Joyce Flueckiger (1991), A.J. Ramanujan (1991), Raheja and Gold (1994), Margaret Mills, and many others have all drawn attention to the way women in different cultures use stories and songs to express their own often subversive and distinctive viewpoints. Raheja and Gold point out, for example, that the way that South Asian women understand their cultural world is often overlooked because researchers attended only to 'authoritative' male discourses and practices. In ordinary interviews, Raheja and Gold found that women are often in agreement with dominant discourses about gender, kinship, and politics.[1] Women's creative reimaginings 'only emerged in the particular contexts in which women invoked them' (Raheja & Gold 1994:24).

It is the general consensus that the perspectives of women and their contribution to the making and remaking of Kalasha culture have been neglected in the Kalasha literature—probably because Kalasha formal, public culture is very much male-centric (cf. & Darling 1979; Parkes 1983, 1988; Loude & Lièvre 1988; Cacopardo & Cacopardo 1989). It is important to attend not only to what is grand and exotic about Kalasha ritual life, but also to the ongoing activities of everyday life—life on the ground, the care and feeding of children, the rhythm of work through the seasons, the cycle of generations. The lullabies women make and sing for children are part of this informal, everyday world. Hopefully, by looking at their songs we can get some sense of what individual Kalasha people most value about their culture and one another.

Finally, I want to conclude this paper with thoughts I've been having about a running conversation, partly with Saifullah Jan[2] (and mostly in my own head) about the value of anthropological research like mine which is, after all, mostly theoretical and descriptive and seemingly not immediately pragmatic or helpful. Do we have anything at all, something concrete and beneficial, to give to the people who have been so generous to us with their time, and with their lives?

I am not a folklorist nor an ethnomusicologist, so I first started collecting Kalasha lullabies simply because women offered them up to me, more or less as gifts. As I became more engaged by them, I went around with my tape recorder and actively asked women to sing for me the songs they had written or the songs they knew. While the creation of lullabies is primarily a women's genre, like most things in Kalasha culture, the divisions are not strict and absolute and men sometimes think up songs for children or grandchildren also. The songs are made for young children, usually for one's own child or most commonly grandchild, but sometimes also for nieces and nephews or neighbours. Not everyone composes songs, of course. It is a special skill and some women are renowned throughout the valleys for the way that their songs trip out of nowhere and stir the heart. Though there are common themes, each song is different, peculiar to the particular child and context, complete with names and places and associated events. Especially lovely or engaging songs are remembered through the years and spread across the valleys as women go home to visit relatives.

One afternoon as I was visiting up-valley, I came across the mother-in-law of a friend of mine who had just had a baby girl. 'Hey, Gilliana Ispress!,' I asked, 'aren't you going to write a song for your new grandchild?'

'Oh,' she said, 'no. She's too little yet. Shimindyaka. I don't know her face yet. I don't know what she is like. When she gets a little older, then I'll know her, and then I'll know what it is I want to say to her.' Gillian's mother-in-law thus carefully corrected a flaw in the way I had been thinking. I had assumed that the singer creates a lullaby as a way of associating an undifferentiated baby to the places and relationships which, in effect, give the baby his/her identity. Rather, as Gillian's mother-in-law's comment demonstrates, lullabies are an introduction of a little individual with a unique personality to the community in which she/he will grow up. In fact, the word for lullaby is '*su'da ishpaDay'ak ghÖ,*' which means 'song to greet the child with kisses' (the way women greet relatives and very close friends they haven't seen for a while).

The very particularity of these songs is striking. In comparison, the Western lullabies with which I am familiar seem horribly generic—as if sung from no one to no one. Kalasha lullabies, in contrast, always include many specific people. Specific individuals are always named in songs, and fathers and grandfathers and mothers' brothers, aunts and grandmothers celebrated for their work and lives, while playmates and cousins set the scene of the spirit of the place in the present generation. The lineage of male ancestors is an important feature of Kalasha society, but women's lives tend to be about pulling diverse personalities and situations and faraway places together in the present. Lullabies represent the strong value women place on integration, on holding together both sides of their family. Songs commonly celebrate children's maternal and paternal relative in the same stanza, linking in song important emotional and economic ties which often go unmarked in more formal genres of speech and song.

Associated with each and every person is the place to which he or she belongs, and this points up an important cultural value. From the outside, the Kalasha valleys may look small, but from the inside they are vast and varied, with almost every field and pasture and spring and valley and rise having a specific name. Each place has a particular history of people and their lives and stories and the changes each made in the cultural landscape. Many songs

celebrate the chaos of many visitors tramping through and the children who run by in a blur kicking up dust (like a flock of goats on the mountainside). The relationship of people to one another and the inseparability of human connections to the land they live in and work on is by far the most pervasive theme in these lullabies.

Another important thread is a running commentary about gender, about the configuration and reconfiguration of men's and women's roles, responsibilities, values, and relationships. Like most people in South and Central Asia, Kalasha people hope for at least one, and preferably many sons. Only sons inherit land and immovable property, and so it is to their own boys that parents look for security and care as they grow older. Boys carry parents' names and memories and land into the future. As much as daughters are loved, not to have a son is a great tragedy. Yet as explicitly necessary as boys are, a family's wealth depends on the intelligence, resourcefulness, and diligence of women. This tension, underplayed in everyday discourse, is explicitly highlighted in lullabies. Shuar Begim's grandmother, for example (in the song transcribed above), describes the list of people who teasingly referred to her baby granddaughter as worthless and coy and a list of other unsavoury adjectives, and then goes on to associate the child with the power and greatness of her maternal and paternal grandfathers, and ends with 'come flowing up to heavenly Kalashagrom, flocks of sheep and goats following you, filling the valley.' Thus, an image of daughters as less valuable because they leave their natal homes is replaced by a salient image of women as bringers of wealth and power.

Common to many of the songs I collected, is women's celebration and assertion of their essential freedom and autonomy. Many lullabies begin with the form, 'Don't cry my daughter (or son), I'm not going anywhere (or I'll take you with me when I go).' With this phrase, women express their fundamental autonomy as an essential cultural value. Both in song and in everyday conversations, women affirm their right to move freely through the valley. In reality, most women stay close to home, their responsibilities tying them to land and children (though many women have been to Uyun and Chitral, 'down-valley' to Peshawar and Islamabad and Lahore, and, recently, one girl is said to have gone to England). But freedom for them lies not so much in actuality, as in possibility, in choice. Women feel they *choose* to be wives and mothers, choose whether to stay (with their husbands and families) or to go. Most choose, of course, to stay, but the fact that this choice is theirs to make is an essential ethnic marker, something they feel differentiates them from neighbouring cultural groups.

Indeed in lullabies, women sing not only of their freedom, but also of the importance of autonomy and independence of the entire Kalasha community. They sing of themselves as kings and ministers and presidents, and not, as they are often portrayed from the outside, as weak and threatened and dependent. 'I won't give my vote to anyone else,' sings one of my favourite songwriters, 'I myself will sit on the throne.' 'Your grandfather was a king, and your mother's brother a great minister.' Or, 'Your father took barren land and built a sweet bazaar.' These songs continuously express pride in being autonomous people and in taking care of themselves.

Moreover, much popular literature deals with the Kalasha as a cultural isolate, a clue to the region's past perhaps, but not a player in the present political scene. In fact, many songs display remarkable knowledge of the world outside of the valley, as well as considerable interest and insight into local, regional, and international politics. M.P. Bandara (owner of Murree Brewery and former minority representative) makes his way into two or three songs, as does the district commissioner, and 'Sadar' Bush. Women sing of Peshawar, Islamabad, Kabul, Saudi Arabia, India, Germany, France, London, America, and Russia. Some songs make complicated links between family and regional politics, as in one song in which a

woman compares being cast out of her son's house because of a dispute with her daughter-in-law to a dispute some years ago in which most of the residents of Ramboor marched out of the valley to protest a dispute over the forest.

In these lullabies then, politics run up every level, from family life to global issues. Kalasha women are clearly interested and involved in the political world, and see political issues as key elements they wish to pass on to their children—the intricacies, disappointments, and joys of living in the Kalasha community, and the relationship of this community to the larger world.

My conclusion is probably already obvious; however, I propose that spelling out the obvious is what anthropologists do best—perhaps it is all we can do. And yet it seems to me that often what is most obvious is most often overlooked—by development workers and government agencies and by local people themselves. Arjun Appadurai (1990) writes that one contribution cultural anthropologists can make is to say the obvious, to identify values which are fundamental to the community so that these ideas can guide the ultimate trajectory of development projects (rather than values which are imported and therefore sometimes ineffective or inappropriate).

One reason these *su'da ishpaDay'ak ghÖ* are interesting to me is that they are not about things outsiders like me usually think about when we think about the Kalasha valleys—they aren't usually about festivals or costumes or Sajigor or Mahandeo or merit feasts. The songs express ideas even more simple and obvious, and so they also offer us the opportunity to learn what women think is important to teach their year-and-a-half-old children:

- The reverence for the physical place in which they live and the essential connection of people to land
- The freedom and independence of Kalasha women and their right to make choices about how they live their lives.
- The great pride in the autonomy of the larger Kalasha community and inseparability of Kalashadesh from Chitral, Pakistan, and the rest of the world.

As to the well-founded question about the practical value of purely academic research, this, then, is what I have to offer:

I think that intelligent, indigenous projects which honour these principles will be both successful and beneficial.

Acknowledgements

Research in the Kalasha valleys (1993–95) was funded by grants from Fulbright (United States Educational Foundation in Pakistan), the National Science Foundation, Wenner-Gren, the Social Science Research Council, PEO, and the American Institute of Pakistan Studies. Special thanks go to Faizi, Washlim Gul, and my friends in Chet Guru for patient help with transcription and translation, and to all the Kalasha people who offered their songs and stories and friendship. Thanks also are due to Sher Afzal Lal and family who opened their home to me while I was staying in Chitral.

NOTES

1. See also Keesing (1985).
2. Saifullah Jan is currently the elected representative for the Kalasha. He has worked closely with every Western researcher and development worker who has come to the Kalasha valleys, and quite rightly, has begun to question the value of work like mine. Because I too struggle with issues of representation, anthropology as a continuation of Western colonialism, and the pragmatic value of purely academic research, I valued our conversations for his creative and multisided insights.

References

Abu-Lughod, L. 1986. *Veiled Sentiments: Honor and Poetry in a Bedouin Society*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Appadurai, A. 1990. Technology and the Reproduction of Values in Rural Western India. In *Dominating Knowledge: Development, Culture and Resistance*, ed. Fredrique Apffel and Stephen A. Marglin. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Cacopardo, Alberto, & Augusto Cacopardo. 1989. The Kalasha (Pakistan) Winter Solstice Festival. *Ethnology*, Vol. XXVIII, 4: pp. 317–29.

Darling, Elizabeth G. 1979. Merit Feasting among the Kalash Kafirs of Northwest Pakistan. MA thesis, University of British Columbia.

Grima, B. 1991. The Role of Suffering in Women's Performance of Paxto. In *Gender, Genre, and Power in South Asian Expressive Traditions*, ed. A. Appadurai, F. Korom and M. Mills. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

_____, 1992. *The Performance of Emotion among Paxtun Women*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Keesing, Roger. 1985. Kwaio Women Speak: The Micropolitics of Autobiography in a Solomon Island Society. *American Anthropologist*, 87: pp. 27–39.

Loude, Jean-Yves, & Lièvre. 1988. *Kalash Solstice*. Islamabad: Lok Virsa.

Parkes, Peter. 1983. Alliance and Elopement: Economy, Social Order and Sexual Antagonism among the Kalash (Kalash Kafirs) of Chitral. D.Phil thesis University of Oxford.

_____, 1990. Livestock Symbolism and Pastoral Ideology among the Kafirs of the Hindu Kush. *Man* 22: pp. 637–60.

Raheja, Gloria Goodwin, & Ann Grodzins Gold 1994, *Listen to the Heron's Words: Reimagining Gender and Kinship in North India*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Ramanujan, A.K. 1991. Toward a Counter-system: Women's Tales. In Appadurai, A., F. Korom, and M. Mills (eds), *Gender, Genre, and Power*.

Trawick, M. 1990. *Notes on Love in a Tamil Family*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

_____, 1991. Wandering Lost: A Landless Laborer's Sense of Place and Self. In Appadurai, A., F. Korom, and M. Mills (eds), *Gender, Genre, and Power*. pp. 224–66.

16

TRADITIONAL DANCE OF CHITRAL AND GILGIT

*Rahmat Akbar Khan Rahmat**

Dance should not be considered in isolation; it has developed under the influence of other things, including the musical instruments and the vocal accompaniment of the dance—the songs sung, their rhythms, and their meanings. Dance is the movement of the parts of the body in specific prescribed motions in times of happiness in accompaniment to instruments and voices. From ancient times, human happiness has been born in the mind and expressed by the body. Wherever human beings live they engage in forms of dance in times of happiness or on special occasions. In the beginning, perhaps, humans danced without any particular order; then later, gradually, different styles of dancing developed—fast or slow—depending on the instruments or the vocal accompaniment. Just like other aspects of human culture, dance keeps on developing and progressing. At first, people struck their hands together to produce sounds, i.e. clapping. Later, stones or sticks were struck together to produce sounds, and words were joined and linked with rhythm and melody to give songs. Then dance developed according to different rhythms and melodies. In order to further the development of dance, people continued to invent new musical instruments. Progressing from sticks and stones, they also began to use skin (leather) and iron in their instruments. Now there are innumerable kinds of music and musical instruments. Every region and every group of people has its own types of musical instruments; styles of dance are also unique to each part of the world. Dance has continued to and will continue to develop and progress. As old dance forms are lost, new ones arise to take their places, and new types of instruments are invented. Now let us turn to traditional Khowar dance.

Traditional Khowar Dance

How did traditional Khowar dance begin and how has it developed? My opinion about Khowar dance is that, without learning it from anyone else, the Kho people have developed a unique style of dance, music, and instruments. After using their old, simple methods, the people of Chitral have from day to day, learning new methods and composing new songs, continued to develop their dance and musical culture. Progressing from the use of sticks and stones, they began to make use of leather and wire. The tambourine (*daf*), drums (*dol*), a large wooden flute (*surnai*), the *damāma*, a pair of small drums (*bam* and *zil*) held between the feet and played with small sticks, *sitar*, and flute came into use. Composing different tunes and rhythms, people began to dance in different styles. From ancient times, the peoples of Gilgit, Chitral, Baltistan, and the adjoining areas have shared a common way of life; in fact, they were a single people. History tells us that these areas were at times under a common rule.

---

* Chapali, Mastuj. Tehsil The original paper is in Khowar; the translation was done by Elena Bashir.

Even now, many aspects of material and non-material culture—items of daily use, festivals, and life rituals—are common to the peoples of these regions. In particular, the style of singing and dancing has not changed. In spite of having many different languages, the style of singing is common; a single *hang* (style) is sung both in Khowar and in Shina. The names of the old song types (*hang*) are the same, and the style of dancing is the same. The people of Gilgit and Chitral have contributed together to the progress of culture in this area.

To bring beauty to their music, the people of Chitral and Gilgit took melodies from the birds and rendered them with their own voices and instruments. It is appropriate to give an example of this. There is a bird called *qoqnuz* which collects pieces of wood for an entire year and sits on the collected wood on an appointed day, flaps its wings, and begins to sing. Some of the young men of Chitral took their *sitars*, and hiding from the *qoqnuz*, copied its songs with their *sitars*. Each of these young men selected a specific tune for himself and named it after himself. These tunes are played on the *sitar* even today; the names of these songs and those people's names are: Ali Sher Khan, Shah Murad Khan, Berangi, and 'Krui Kumooru' ('The Red Girl'). In addition to these, the Kho people, composing their own original poetry and songs, have given them various names. A song which is sung very slowly is called *peréez* (slow, drawn-out singing); some songs are sung in an intermediate style, neither very fast nor very slow (*ausét*); and some are sung very fast. Dance styles are also identified corresponding to these three styles of singing: slow, medium, and fast.

The best-known styles (*hang*) of Khowar singing are the following: *dáni, barwazí, šabdaráz, šištuwáar, tatáLi-wawáLi, hunzigwáar, náno žan, khongóro sáwz, lalo žurgoLót/lekžuúr, žuúržaLúung, thámnaT, sawz, žangwáar, ɣaLwáar, aLɣaniwáar, muráLi, Cóong rigíSi, noxtik, pasték*, and others.

dáni. *These* tunes are danced slowly and 'heavily' from the beginning. Both in the beginning and at the end there is a series of jumps. Dancing the *dáni* tunes is more difficult than the other styles; it requires much delicacy and subtlety. It has to be danced with great care and attention, listening to and following the changing rhythms of the *dol* and *surnai* or flute. The following *dánis* are very famous: *sardár metáro dáni, mir walí metáro dáni, Laspró hakímo dáni, yarxúno hakímo dáni, loT dáni, aráp xáno dáni*, and others. It will be appropriate to tell a little about the background of each of these dances and give a few lines from the songs that accompany them.

1. *sardár metáro dáni.* Sardar Mehtar falls in love and writes a song to his beloved. In spite of hearing his song, she remains silent, showing neither pleasure nor anger. A few words of his song are:

awá lu doóm tu ko xut — I speak and you are silent—but why?
khάaL briúsian xut ba xut — All too soon we will both die.
don durdána šun yaqút — With teeth of pearl and ruby lips,
žanó sáar xoš tu táan — You are dearer to me than life.
Daq bathánáar bewathάan — I will forsake my homeland, choosing homelessness.
dust ki máte no bosáan — If you will not be my friend!
ma kya haját ya bathάan — What need have I of this land!

2. *mir wáli metáro dáni.* The background of Mir Wali Mehtar's *dáni* and a few lines of it are as follows. Mir Wali Mehtar's beloved is the daughter of an important landholder of the area. She has a big dowry (cattle, bedding, household goods); as she takes it to her husband's house a great number of cows and many dozen goats pass through the lanes of the thickly settled

village. The poet's beloved has gaps between her teeth; delicate bubbles come through the gaps between her teeth, which burst when she speaks. The poet likens these bubbles to buds which burst into blossoms. For him, this is balm for his soul. Mir Wali (the lover) describing this, says:

Duúm dehó mužén, mažáán	Through the deep lanes of the dense village, o my dear
raféq jéez angói, nó-aa	My beloved brings her dower goods.
mut donán Zengén, žan-éé	From the gaps between her teeth of moonstone
žanó wéez angói, nó-aa	She brings balm for my soul.

3. *Laspró hakímo dáni*. The real name of the *hakim* of Laspur was Mir Shah, whose beloved was a very famous woman. Her mother would send her here and there on spurious errands to prevent her from being taken away by her lover. At the end, when they give her to another man, Mir *hakim* says the following:

ta nan ta kureén kaseé ta gudáaz areér	Your mother wore you out, sending you here and there.
asmanáar sayúurj xomí xošó Dáaz areér	A falcon swooped down and snatched away my beloved.

Using unusual complimentary language about his rival, the poet compares his beloved's husband to a falcon.

4. *yarxúno hakímo dáni*.

Yarkhun is Chitral's northernmost frontier—near the boundary of Wakhan. Abdul Murat Khan, the Hakim of Yarkhun, was a very sophisticated and sensitive person. This song was sung by his beloved to his friends on an occasion when he had gone to play polo. He was a very good polo player; she praises him in the following words.

hakím jalsoóte bíran-	My hakim is going to a polo match—
hakímo vesúur.	Wait for him.
ma kuhó babaáti mayún	My golden oriole, worthy of the lush lowlands,
sarháda asuúr.	Bides in the harsh frontier.
awá ju kaLúm nezíko	When I compose a few lines of song
tu kos žibós bíim?	Why do you become fearful?
išqó kormán jam huS korói	The hakim of Yarkhun
yarxúno hakíim.	Knows well the ways of passion.

barwazí. This song is written about an old woman named Barwazi. She is an important personage, preceded by an impressive reputation. When she is travelling to distant places orders are given for her reception and help in all the villages. Thinking that she will have a lot of baggage, the people arrange for a party of men to carry her baggage; arrangements for her meals are also made. All the people are interested and eager to see her; she is a very important woman and they want to meet her. But when Barwazi comes they see that there are no people accompanying her, nor is there any baggage. She has only one skin bag of wool and one skin bag of $SoSp^2$, her food for the road. Then, complaining about their disappointment in her appearance, the people sing the following satirical song.

barwazío waw-ée	Old Lady Barwazi—
barwazí xomiítai	Barwazi has descended on us.
áan díti xomiítai	She came down over the mountain.
wáwo báar ambóh-ée	Hey, what a lot of baggage she has—
i burdíkia poSp-ée	One skin bag of wool,
i burdíkia SoSp-ée	One skin bag of SoSp!
utáxan bLatshawuur	Collect everything for her needs,
ser pónan sawzáwuur.	Fix up all the bridges and roads!

While dancing *barwazi*, the dancers wear the *šuqa*[3] and move from side to side and forward and backward taking slow, elongated steps. The style of this dance imitates the actions of an eagle. In the old days, the dancers placed their hats on the ground, imagining them to be partridges hiding from fear. Spreading the sleeves of their *šuqa*, they imitated the flight of an eagle. They approached the hat with arms held close to their sides, imitating a bird of prey stealthily stalking a partridge. When they are not able to catch it, they again spread their arms (wings), go back, and fly around. During the course of the dance they repeat these motions several times. By the end of the dance they still do not succeed in catching the partridge (hat). The dance of *barwazí* is very difficult; very few people are able to do it.

***šabdaráz* (long night).** This is also a heavy, slow dance, and is danced while wearing the *šuqa*. The poet of *šabdaráz* thinks about his beloved all night and is not able to sleep. Thus, the night seems very long to him. For this reason, the word *šabdaráz* is repeated from time to time during the poem, and the song is also called 'šabdaráz.' His beloved is in love with an older man. The poet addresses these lines to her.

zarúo dust mo gané	Don't take an old man as your love;
sulúkan huS no korói.	He won't understand how to treat you properly. This is not proper.
se beqaidá.	Your teeth are moonstone from Delhi,
juwáan ta qadró korói	A young man would appreciate you;
se ta faidá. éé šabdaráz	That would be good for you, o long lonely night.
ta don dilío mut	Your throat as transparent as glass,
ta goóL bayáaz, éé šabdaráz.	O, my long lonely night.

***šištuwáar*.** This is a very old style (*hang*). It is accompanied by the drum and *surnai*. A large number of men wearing the *šuqa* form a line, following the leading dancer and imitating his movements. Following one after another, the line of dancers move in a circle. Then coming to stand in a line facing the musicians, first putting the right foot forward and moving it around in a circle while tapping the ground,[4] each dancer slowly makes a complete revolution; then he does the same thing while keeping his right foot in place and moving his left foot, and then once more, keeping the left foot in place and moving the right foot—for a total of three revolutions. Returning to his original standing position, each dancer *salaams* the musicians then begins a quick dance, rotating in circles with each dancer maintaining his own position. This is the last movement of the dance.

tatáLi-wawáLi (ducks). This dance is also danced with the dancers wearing the *šuqa* and following each other in a line, as in the *šištuwáar*. Like the *barwazí*, this dance is also the imitation of birds. The dancers follow each other in a circle, imagining that the sleeves of their *šuqa* are wings, and imitate the motions of flying. One dancer, holding a rifle or long stick in his right hand, makes a waving, shooing motion with his left hand, waving the sleeves

of his *šuqa* to drive the ducks into a position favourable for him—stalking, moving here and there, aiming his gun, pulling it back and moving to another place, waiting until a time when all the ducks are lined up, to get a better shot. His hands and feet follow the rhythm of the music, becoming faster or slower according to the music. During the dance, the dancer playing the hunter moves around the other dancers at a distance. At the conclusion of the dance, when the dancers ('ducks') form a line, the hunter moves into a position imagined to be a breastwork (*bánguT*), aims his rifle and cries, '*Tááx*,' imitating the sound of a gun firing. The rest of the dancers, mimicking ducks flying up in disorder from the duck pond, moving hither and thither in front of and behind each other, leave the dancing ground. This dance is very enjoyable.

hunzigwáar. The *hunzigwáar* is danced in a slow, heavy manner, swaying the body from side to side. It is a *sawz*-rhythm dance, that is, a fast dance, but it is the slowest of them.

thámnaT. *The thámnaT* is a very fast dance. Both the instrumental music and the dancing are fast. This dance comes at the end of a festival or dance programme (*išTók*).

aLɣaniwáar. In the ***aLɣaniwáar*** style, Khowar words are sung to an Afghan (i.e., Pashto) rhythm. This is a fast dance.

lálozáng. This is another fast dance.

muráLi. On the night preceding the circumcision of a son, dancing of many different dances and singing continue all night until dawn and even on until broad daylight. The boy to be circumcised is dressed in new clothes; a handkerchief is tied around his neck and a garland of apricot kernels is placed around his neck. Then a man takes the boy and dances with him. This is done to dispel the boy's fear of the coming circumcision. In this dance style (*hang*) the drum and *surnai* are played. Other people also come to dance before the boy in order to make him happy. After this, the circumcision is done.

hamángi. At the time of sending off a daughter to her (new) husband's home, this song is sung. The dancers precede the girl, dancing along in a procession. This dance (*hamángi*) and *žuuržúLúng* are performed in Yasin even today.

žuúržaLúng. This dance is performed on the occasion of the marriage of a youngest son and also on the occasion of the circumcision of a youngest son. Lighting a fire on top of a large iron griddle (*taw*) to provide light, the dancers dance in a circle around the fire holding each other by the hand. Releasing each other's hands, they continue dancing in a circle and then again take each other's hands. This sequence is repeated five or six times. Performing this dance is called *žuúržaLúng korík*. The words of the song accompanying this dance are as follows.

žuúržuLúng kóman hanún ma žawó anús;	On this day I perform my son's circumcision rites,
ažélian xošanío kóman ma nang ožo namús.	Celebrating my children and my own honour and pride.
Chetráarar Dóok táw angoóm;	From far Chitral I will bring a domed griddle;
hatéra jam rošt koróm.	And on it light a bright fire.
bujáyoó[5] dróxum surnai	The surnai of the House of Bujayé is of silver;
jam bápo nowés jam birái.[6]	The grandson of a good grandfather will be a good man.

noxtík. This is a unique dance. It was very famous in the *sarhad* (distant, rugged, high-altitude) parts of Chitral. In a house where a celebration, for example a wedding, was taking place, this dance was danced first of all. It is done as follows. About five to ten young men holding each other by the hand form a line and set out singing for the house of celebration. They start singing the *noxtík* songs in loud voices outside the wall of the house compound or in the courtyard of the house. Hearing the song, the people inside the house clear a space for them. Then the *noxtík* starts. A pair of young men at one end of the line start to sing the *noxtík* song. When the pair at one end finishes singing, the pair at the other end begins to sing. These singers at the ends of the line do not dance; they only sing.

In the centre of the line of *noxtík* dancers, an experienced dancer squeezes the hands of the two men next to him in line, to signal to them that the next movement of the dance is to begin. The signal is passed on down the line from dancer to dancer by each dancer squeezing the hand of the person next to him. Each new movement of the dance is signalled by the leader in this way.

Then all the dancers stamp their feet in unison and call out, '*háa láál, háa ha*' in unison. The sequence of movements is as follows. (1) First, standing firm on the left leg and keeping the heel of the right foot on the ground, they tap the ground with the right foot. (2) Then they raise the right knee quickly and put it down several times, waiting for the signal for the next movement. (3) Then, planting the left foot slightly behind the right foot, the dancers bend their right knees, dipping progressively closer to the ground. At the signal, they touch their right knees down to the ground and then rise quickly. Then they kneel down on one knee quickly and rise quickly several times, waiting for the signal for the next stage of the dance. (4) In the next movement, the line sways first to the left, the dancers extending the left foot sideways; then the line sways to the right, the dancers extending the right foot sideways. Then, at the signal, standing on the left foot, the right foot is swung forward and to the left. This motion is repeated several times. Then, the dancers standing on the right foot, the left foot is swung out and to the right. At the next signal, the dancers jump up and stand very straight, then kneel down quickly on one knee. Repeating this several times, they end up in the kneeling position. This is the end of the dance.

Two songs accompanying the *noxtík* are '*máal*' (or *zrinžéeri*), and '*Dúsra bap.*' Two lines from '*máal (zrinžéeri)*' are:

zrinžéerio taw dráaru, kya máal-éé máal[7]	They started baking bread for your celebration, o Maal.
taw dreé maylís wa kardú wa	Then they held the festivities.

'*Dúsra bap*' is a humorous satirical song, poking fun at a man named Dusra and his hunting. It goes very well with the dance style of *noxtík*. Some of the words are:

Dúsra háte bápo bayúot maSkuúr	Call Old Man Dusra to go hunting;
Dúsra háte bápo samánan angyóor	Bring Old Man Dusra's hunting gear—
Dúsra háte bápo pušíri kirkóT	Old Man Dusra and his foot wraps of cat skin[8]
Dúsra háte bápo čantrúken Zikán.	Old Man Dusra and his laces of vine stems.[9]
rom čhíti ta múuLtu Cokít	The herd has broken and is coming up toward him;
Dúsra háte bápo thuék čikít.	Old Man Dusra's rifle is only a popgun.[10]

Pasték

The singing for the *pasték* begins right after the *noxtík* finishes. To begin the *pasték*, three men sing 'háa, láal, háa hah, šáabáš háa hah,' in unison. Clapping once in unison, all three

men face inward toward each other; then turning quickly and clapping once they all face outward away from each other. Repeating these motions, the group of three describe a circular path. After this circuit, they take each other's arms, they lift their legs and bending their knees, gradually dip closer and closer to the ground. Then they sit down quickly and get up quickly. This sitting down and getting up is done while revolving in a circle. The dancer rises in the same place where he sits down; that is he sits down, revolves, returns to his initial position, then rises. Several circuits like this are done first to the right and then several to the left. The two singers near them sing from the beginning to the end of the dance.

The songs that are sung with the *pasték* are (i) '*guláh*' and (ii) '*dáledarbánd.*' In *guláh* the lover addresses his beloved. Some of the words are:

ma gul wa ɣečhário taít, ée wóorgóLióo	My Gul, you are a charm against the evil eye; o, fragrant-throated one.
froskío kuThúa ta nezím reém, la ma žan-éé.	I would fasten you to my right shoulder, I wish; o, my dear one.
ma gul wa boɣák bíti bis, ée wóorgóLióó	My Gul, you are going away; o, fragrant-throated one.
ma kyaní korí bis reém, la ma žan-éé?	What will you do for me before you go, I ask; o, my dear one.
xoi ma kos hósta táan det, ée wóorgóLióó	Either give me into someone's care; o, fragrant-throated one
xoi ma ganí táan bogé reém, la ma žan-éé.	Or take me with you, I plead; o, my dear one.

A few verses from 'dáledarbánd' are given here. The lines are addressed by the poet to his beloved, who lives in a place called Daledarband.

dáledarbánd-éé miránan babaát	O, Daledarband, worthy of kings.
gíko-éé goóman-áá ɣóoš no boói.	Were you to call me I would come; but I don't have the chance.
dáledarbánd-éé xuránan žaɣá	O, Daledarband, the abode of *houris*.
gíko-éé goóman-áá ɣóoš no boói.	Were you to call me I would come; but I don't have the chance.
dáledarbánd-éé čilíkio táan čháaɣ	O, Daledarband, cool shade of the weeping willow.
gíko-éé goóman-áá ɣóoš no boói.	Were you to call me I would come; but I don't have the chance.
dáledarbánd-éé SabLúkio táan gáaz	O, Daledarband, fragrant fields of clover.
gíko-éé goóman-áá ɣóoš no boói.	Were you to call me I would come; but I don't have the chance.

Cóong rigíSi (beard that sticks out horizontally). This is a playful dance in the form of a drama. It is also called *aLók samaá*. This dance drama used to be performed in the frontier areas of Chitral on special occasions. It is a happy shepherds' festival, celebrated when the goats are brought back down from the high pastures to the village at the beginning of winter. The village shepherds[11] take along other young men to sing and dance with them, starting at the top or bottom of the village and visiting each house turn by turn. Dancing from house to house, they receive the items of compensation due to them[12] and at midnight gather at a selected house, cook a meal, and sing and dance all night.

Another version of this dancing and singing (*išTók*) is as follows. A big pumpkin shell is prepared, and holes for eyes and mouth are cut to fit in front of the eyes and mouth of the wearer. Big teeth of white wood are fixed into the mouth, and a big nose made of dough is attached; then mustache, eyebrows, and beard made of goat hair are glued to the pumpkin shell. One of the most experienced shepherds fastens it over his face and dances. At night, the shepherds play the tambourine first in the courtyard of the house to announce their arrival. The people of the house, even if they are asleep, let them in. They begin to dance in the area

near the door used to store firewood (*šom*) or in the area around the central hearth (*phéran lašT*). During this time, wearing the pumpkin shell on his face like a mask and wearing frightening clothes and carrying a bundle bound on his back, the main dancer (*bap* 'old man') comes forward in front of the other dancers. Seeing him, the children are frightened. He sings the following song while continuing to dance.

Cóong rigíSi, Cóongi bááp,	You with your beard sticking out—sticking-out bearded old man,
Cóong rigíSo dóna det;	Grab your sticking-out beard between your teeth;
just awánan méha det.	Tie both skirts of your *šuqa* behind your back.
bap ki pišawúr bayái	If the old man goes to Peshawar,
tan wáwote kyaáγ angói?	What will he bring for his old woman?
sot batí gizgíz angói;	Seven *batí*[13] of *gizgíz*[14]—,
wáwo asmanén angói.	He will take his old woman to heaven.

There are many humorous and bawdy verses and songs sung during the *bap's* (the shepherd with the pumpkin mask) dance. At one point during the *bap's* dance they dress up a stick in women's clothes and drape it with a veil, making it into the shape of a woman. Then they bring the woman figure to the front of the crowd of people standing around. The dancing *bap* sees it and is delighted. While he is dancing he asks for a pipe to smoke. They give him a lighted piece of wood as a pipe. He puts one end of the stick in his mouth and begins to cough in imitation of the effect of smoke going down his throat. After this, the *bap* resumes dancing. He advances toward the woman figure and pretends to be afraid, then retreats, dancing all the while. Then he approaches her again and taps her quickly. When he does this the onlookers encourage him by clapping and playing the tambourine. He grabs for her and retreats three or four times, then finally he seizes the woman figure with both hands and holding her around the waist begins to dance with her. While dancing with her he also wrestles with her. Twice he falls backward with the woman figure falling on top of him (giving the appearance that the woman has knocked him down). The third time he knocks her down and falls on top of her. The wooden woman figure breaks. Then a group of people take the role of her father's relatives and two of them say to the *bap*, 'You have killed our daughter; give us her blood price.' Then the *bap* approaches each person in turn and asks for a contribution toward the penalty. He sits in the lap of each person and does not get off until that person has given him something. Thus each person gives him something or other: someone gives him money, someone gives him a handkerchief, someone gives him something else, and so on.

The shepherds play this game at each house. In this way they manage to collect a lot of things and money, since the shepherds are owed payment by every household. The mature goats grazed by the shepherds during the summer are slaughtered at the beginning of winter. The ribs of these goats are the shepherd's share. They are also given tea, salt, *ghee* or fat, and firewood. Until midnight they go from house to house. Then at midnight they gather at another, pre-arranged, house, cook the foodstuffs they have received, and sing and dance until dawn. Since they are not able to visit all the houses in the village in one night, they visit the rest on another night and do the same thing. This song-and-dance drama is called *bap bík* or *qalamdarí*.

The preceding paragraphs have discussed some of the traditional songs and dances of the people of Chitral and Gilgit. Now, it is necessary to discuss the proper rules and conventions of Khowar dancing.

Rules and Conventions of Khowar Dancing

Every art has its own rules, methods, principles, and rules of courtesy and protocol. When a person dances, he draws the attention of a large gathering of people to himself. Thus, the dancer should observe the rules and principles of the dance. If the dancer's pride and self-confidence, his skill, his emotion, and his enthusiasm are expressed in a precise, controlled, and structured way, everyone will enjoy his dance. Then he will be considered a skilful and principled artist.

Today, however, the principles of dance are not being observed. The dancer simply comes forward and moves his body and hands to the rhythm of clapping or of the drum and tambourine. He just displays his youth and strength, his enthusiasm, and his technical skill to get praise from the spectators. Most of the onlookers also do not know the rules and proper order of the dance. Even a horse or a kid will dance to the music of a beautiful tune, but human beings should follow principles. For this reason, it necessary to describe the rules and principles of dancing, so that the difference between the disordered jumping around of the *aLganiwáar* style and the controlled movements of the Khowar style can be understood.

In the old days, dancing and singing for the *mehtars* was very important. To earn the praise of the *mehtars* was considered great good fortune. For this reason, people interested in dancing went to a teacher to learn it properly. The *mehtars* invited very distinguished people from their areas to dance at their gatherings. Sometimes the *mehtar* would invite the members of his cabinet and the royal family to very special, exclusive gatherings. Even some of the *mehtars* themselves danced in these exclusive groups. For this reason, everyone tried to learn the proper rules and principles of dancing, so that if they became good dancers they would be invited to the *mehtar's* special gatherings and have the opportunity of getting close to the *mehtars.*

Among the dances, the *dáni* style is the most famous. There are many different *dáni*s, as I have outlined above, for example, *sardár metáro dáni*, *mir walí metáro dáni*, *Laspró hakímo dáni*, *yarxúno hakímo dáni*, *loT dáni*, *aráp xáno dáni*, and others. Some dancers would specialize in one *dáni*, and others would master another. The dancers would request the instrumentalists to play a certain *dáni*, and it became known which dancer preferred to dance to which *dáni*. Sometimes, the *mehtar* would order a certain man to dance; then the musicians (*Dom*), knowing which *dáni* was preferred by this dancer, would play it even without being asked.

In the old days in the Gilgit area, each *qaum* (tribal or lineage group) had a music style (*hang*) exclusively associated with it. No one except the people of that *qaum* danced in that style. The members of the *qaum* would consider it an insult if anyone else danced in their style.

To dance in the *mehtar's darbars* (courts) was an honour, and if the *mehtar* ordered a person to dance, he was very happy. Those people danced according to the rules, principles, and protocols of the dance. These rules and principles were also followed in other gatherings.

Proper Sequence of Dance Movements

This paragraph describes the proper sequence of dance movements, as they used to be observed. After the drums would begin to play, the dancer would come forward facing the musicians and salute the *mehtar* if he was present, or the other distinguished and high-ranking persons present. Then, in a fixed order, according to the rhythm, he would jump—first

touching the right foot to the ground and then jumping up, then touching the left foot to the ground and jumping. He jumped in this way six or eight times. After this he would face the musicians and spin around in place very fast. Next he would turn around, touching his right foot to the ground while keeping his left foot stationary. Then he would turn to the left, tapping his left foot and keeping his right foot stationary; and then once more reverse direction and tap his right foot. After completing the *tsopík* cycle, he would *salaam* the *mehtar* once, then extend his left hand straight out bent at the elbow, keeping his right hand by his side, and rotate in place to the left. Then he would do the same thing again, this time extending his right hand and rotating to the right. After the sequence of turning in place was executed, the dancer and musicians would pause for a moment.

Then, coming forward to face the drummer, the dancer performed the *tsopík* movements, the quick turning, and the pause in front of the drums. After a pause, the drums played very softly and the dancer slowly moved backward to the far end of the dancing ground, moving backwards in a zigzag sideways progression. Then he would come back toward the musicians, increasing his speed as he approached. At this time, the drum and tambourine would play fast and loud. Then the dancer, with his left hand extended straight out and bent at the elbow, would make two or three fast circuits of the entire dancing ground. He would stop at the far end of the ground and then make two or three circuits in the opposite direction. At the end of the last circuit he would stop at the far end of the dancing ground and, facing the musicians again, perform the same jumping movements that he began with. Next he would come forward to face the musicians and turn rapidly in place, first in one direction, then in the other. After this he would tap his foot on the ground (*tsopík*) while rotating—first to the right, then to the left, then to the right again. Next, he again would come to face the *mehtar* or honoured personalities and salute them, after which he would leave the field.

This order of steps should be followed with each dance type (*hang*), but with the *sawz* and *aLganiwáar* styles it is not followed. With the *dáni*, *hunzigwáar*, and other slow styles, however, it is absolutely necessary to follow these rules.

Conclusion

This has been a description of some of the traditional dance, singing, and music of the peoples of Chitral and Gilgit. Dance, singing, and listening to beautiful sounds and melodies play a great part in creating happiness for human beings. By nature, people do not like to listen to sounds or words of sorrow; one listens to them only out of necessity. Rather, people prefer to give their attention to actions or words which tend to make them happy, and try to keep such things close to themselves in their life. If a person spends one day happily, he or she will remain happy for several days. Since this is so, it is natural for people to take interest in music and dance. If one looks at history, one sees that religious figures of olden days also used music and dance as part of their religious teaching, attracting people to themselves with the sweet sounds of music and then beginning their religious teachings. For example, Maulana Ruum, Moihuddin Chishti, and Nasir-e-Khisrau adopted this method. Even now, the *qawwalis* of *faqirs* at the shrines of saints are important evidence of this. The people of every region should work for the preservation and development of their culture.

Acknowledgements

I want to thank the following people for cooperating with me in the research upon which this study is based: Ustad Taalim Khan and Ustad Dana Khan from Chitral; Ustad Ali Murad Khan; and Ustad Sarfaraz Khan and his company from Bujayat, Yasin, in Gilgit. I am also grateful to Dr Elena Bashir for translating my paper into English.

NOTES

1. Here 'friend' means 'beloved'.
2. *SoSp* is similar to the *halva* of the lowlands. It is made from flour ground from sprouted wheat, which gives it a delicate natural sweetness.
3. A *šuqa* is a long, cloak-like coat of homespun wool with long sleeves.
4. This movement is called *tsopík*.
5. *Bujáoó* is (probably) the name of the house in which the ceremony of *žuúržuLúng* is being celebrated.
6. The last two lines are in ritual praise and celebration of the family lineage.
7. Maal is probably the name of the man whose wedding is being celebrated.
8. Catskin foot wrappings would be very flimsy and not durable.
9. Laces, i.e., thongs to bind the foot wrappings, were usually made of leather; thongs of vine would be weak.
10. A *čikít* is a gun which fires only a tiny bullet.
11. All the villagers' goats were taken out collectively to pasture by four or five shepherds, who were paid compensation by the other villagers.
12. These things include the ribs of one goat, wheat flour, salt, fat from a goat or *ghee*, tea leaves, and two or three pieces of firewood.
13. One *batí* equals 10 *pou* or 2 1/2 *seers* (1 *seer* is slightly less than 1 kilogram).
14. A mineral substance used as an aphrodisiac.

17

THE LONGING FOR A PARADISE ON EARTH: ETHNIC TOURISM TO THE KALASHA

*Jürgen Wasim Frembgen**

Introduction

For many years some of the most outstanding destinations of ethnic tourism have been tribes and peoples such as the Toraja (Celebes), Tuareg, Eskimo, Indians in North, Middle, and South-America (e.g., the San Blas Kuna in Panama), Australian Aborigines, and the Polynesian islanders. In South, West, and Central Asia, however, individual and group travellers unequivocally focus on the archaeology, art, and nature of the respective countries. This region, which was predominantly characterized by ancient civilizations, is also travelled by the ethnic tourists, who chiefly visit villages, observe dances and ceremonies, and buy arts and crafts. Tibet, as well as the Hunzukuts in the Karakoram in Pakistan (as a combination of natural and ethnic tourism) and the Kalasha[1] at the outermost north western border of the country, are the most popular destinations.[2] The minority of the Kalasha (approximately 2500 people, two-thirds of which are non-Muslim) living in three valleys of the remote Hindu Kush belong, together with the ethnic groups mentioned at the beginning, to the so-called 'fourth world.' Valene Smith remarks on these destinations of ethnic tourism: 'Frequently these tourist targets are far removed from the 'beaten path' and attract only a limited number of visitors motivated by curiosity and elite peer approval' (1977: 2).

The Development of Ethnic Tourism to the Kalasha

In comparison with neighbouring ethnic groups of north Pakistan, the Kalasha are scientifically very much explored: at least sixty publications (monographs and articles) are recorded. They are well-known in Pakistan as well as in Western countries due to travel literature and tourism advertising. Attention has been focused on them because they remained the last 'non-believers' (*kafirs*) preserving a pagan culture, which the neighbouring Nuristanis (or Kafirs as they are called in scientific literature) lost in the process of Islamization. One can agree with A.S. Ahmed when he writes: 'There has been, perhaps, more speculation on, and fascination with the Kafirs, than with any other race in Central and South Asia' (1986: 23). Still, anthropologists particularly like doing research among minority cultures—this shows the case of the Kalasha, too. There were about twenty anthropologists in the field (some continue their studies even today) and some younger colleagues planning to do so. Besides these, a considerable number of individual travellers have visited this area since the 1960s and partly tried to live together with the locals for a longer time. A.S. Ahmed (1986:27) says—obviously refering to the 1980s: 'The density of visitors to native population is probably among the highest in the

* State Museum of Ethnography, Munich, Germany.

world including the obligatory Japanese anthropologist and Cambridge female undergraduates in Kalash dresses, gone quite native.'[3] Fascinated by a still pagan population that tries to preserve its traditional culture, hippies frustrated by their own civilization and presumably one or another anthropologist imagined themselves to be in an ideal land, an Arcadia. Here, like elsewhere, the lines between 'alternative travellers,' adventure tourists, hobby-anthropologists, and professional anthropologists are often very blurred[4]—particularly from the perspective of the Kalasha. It is quite interesting to note that the local Pakistani tourists and the so-called study tourists, who since the 1970s have often come for day trips to the Kalasha valley of Bumboret in the course of their programme, never reach an intercultural dialogue. Concerning the touristic development and exploitation, Maureen Lines (1988:191) writes:

> The road which opened up Bumburet in the seventies soon brought this, the widest of the three valleys, to the attention of visitors, and before long unscrupulous entrepreneurs from outside the valley, ventured in, tricked the local people out of a number of their walnut trees..., and some of their land, on which they built ramshackle and primitive hotels, and left the Kalash little chance to make even a few rupees from the new and meagre tourist industry[5]. It should be added that tourism gives only a few Kalasha a second occupation worth mentioning; as Karl Wutt remarks in a letter, 'especially to those, who are anyway relatively rich, for instance some christianized and a few persons converted to Islam, who exploit their own people and present them to foreign visitors.'

The Kalasha in the Mirror of Tourism Advertising

The adoption of Kalasha culture in travelogues, touristic handbooks, catalogues, reports, and films of journalists unveils something about the exotic points of attraction, dreams, and the longing of the individual—and group travellers, and thereby the motivations to embark on such a tour.[6] Light fiction like this, which provides very little information, is mostly the only source of preparation for the concerned area. It influences the tourists' expectations as well as their actual experience and behaviour. In German speaking countries, the chapter on the Kalasha in Helmut Uhlig's book *Am Thron der Götter* (1978; pp. 76–86) seems to have been used as a guide for textwriters of travel brochures and for journalists. In English speaking countries, and in Italy, Fosco Maraini's richly illustrated description of the Dionysical and paradisiacal life of the Kalasha in his *Where Four Worlds Meet* (1964/original Italian edition 1963; pp. 242–70) will have inspired several to take a trip. Many French tourists have read the books of the anthropologists Jean-Yves Loude and Viviane Lièvre before coming to the Kalasha.

The 'Greeks' of Asia

An important aspect of the Kalasha image in tourism advertising is—as with the Hunzukuts—their alleged descent from the soldiers of Alexander the Great, and in connection with that the emphasis on blond hair, light skin colour, and blue eyes.[7] The journalist Hilmar Pabel sees the ethnogenesis as quite simple and clearly attributes it to Alexander's soldiers as a 'historic fact': 'The Kalash are a living proof of their successful endeavours to gain the favour of the local beauties' (1984: 34). The 'myth of the Greek blood' of the Kalasha and neighbouring Kafirs (Nuristani) was mentioned again and again in scientific publications in the past, and recently even in two dubious notes of Kurt Horedt (1990, 1991) in the otherwise respectable

Mitteilungen der Berliner Gesellschaft für Anthropologie, Ethnologie und Urgeschichte, one of which bears the title 'Macedonians at the Hindu Kush.' A Kalasha girl and two children are depicted on a new poster printed in 1997 by WJ Classics (Rawalpindi), the accompanying text leaves no doubt:

> The Kalash tribe, remnant of the Greek army which accompanied Alexander the Great in 326 BC. The fair features of the Kalash race are specially obvious in some of the young children with blond hair and blue eyes. Their centuries old traditions and culture has not changed with the passage of time.

Tourists as Voyeurs: Festivals, Dancing Women, and Shamans

In the afore mentioned light-fiction-feeding-ethnic-tourism, the Kalasha are very idealized. The special emphasis on their animism ('Naturreligion') and figural art and, above all, on their festivals, rituals, and dances, is noticeable. As main attractions, the experience of the spring festival and the dances of female groups and shamans are extolled.[8] In brochures of Studiosus Studienreisen 'The Special Tour—The Spring Festival in Chitral' is one of the headlines. This event is called one of 'the few original non-commercialized festivities in our age.'[9] It is concealed that the local Pakistani travel agency has to pay its contribution to the administration in Chitral Town.

The Kalasha women have the reputation of being especially beautiful and elegant. A.B. Rajput writes for example: 'Beaming with healthiness and favoured by a clear and fresh complexion, the women can be counted among the most appealing representatives of female beauty' (1964: 3).[10] In a trekking-guide it can be read: 'The Kalash women are often very attractive and have an outgoing manner that is disarming, delightful, and unexpected in a region where *purdah* is generally practiced' (Swift 1990: 93). For photographs for tourists they mostly pose only for money, which is sometimes decently mentioned.[11] Women of the still pagan Kalasha, not commiting themselves to *purdah* rules, have also attracted the curiosity of the Pakistani tourists, who—in the feeling of absolute liberty—'want to admire and photograph the women extensively' (Jettmar 1975: 327). Annoyances by tourists not seldom seem to get out of hand and become a virtual chase after women.[12] More commercialized relations between hosts and guests are hardly to be imagined. The women are highly valued as photographic subjects during dances, which originally belonged to religious rituals. The geographer Klaus Haserodt remarks on this topic:

> One has built rest-houses for tourists (in Berer and Bumboret), where nearby unveiled women and girls show excerpts from old ritual dances accompanied by simple songs and drum beats of the men. Such, 'shows' have been taking place for quite a number of years now plus an officially confirmed considerable collection of fees, especially for tourist groups. These fees are considered a reimbursement for the earlier voluntary contributions, yet they lead—understandably—more and more to corruption. (1989: 158, 161)

Here religion becomes commercialized. The dances artificially presented for the tourists in Bumboret and Birir (in the Ramboor valley they were in the meantime forbidden by Saifullah Jan, the official representative of the Kalasha)[13] transmit a 'staged authenticity' (Dean MacCannell). If the Kalasha live up to the expectations of travel agencies and tourists such as these, then they are on their way to degeneration into a collection of odd people. This is what most tourism planners apparently would like for marketing purposes. Until the end of the 1970s, some strategists of the tourism industry demanded a permanent performance of exotic

attractions out of the 'stock' of traditional customs in the sense of a perfectly organized show ignoring the annual cycle of festivals. The Kalasha complied with this concept, as Graham Hancock writes: 'It is thus possible to watch both harvest and crop-sowing festivals in the same day with a few wedding dances thrown in for good measure' (1983: 68). Even if something might have changed in the attitude of travellers in the course of the more considerate 'soft' or 'adapted' tourism propagated in recent years, there is no doubt that the voyeuristic interest in rituals and especially in dances has remained. The foreigners are fascinated by the 'paradise experience' of a jointly performed ritual in which the mythical prehistoric times become present again.[14] A further aspect is attributed to the dances of the Kalasha women, who have been performing for tourists for a fee since the end of the 1950s.[15] Writers focus extensively on 'orgiastic ritual dances' in which people drink wine, and they ascribe to the Kalasha 'loose moral values.'[16] It is perhaps due to this image that a traveller like Hans von Meiss, who already at the end of the 1950s, would go so far as to slap a half-grown-up girl jokingly on her bottom.[17] In another travelogue it is written: 'Their women are not regarded as prudish. This inspires the fantasy and mood of our Muslim companions' (Kregel 1986: XXII). And Maureen Lines observes: 'Numerous jeeps and wagons crammed with young Pakistani males head towards the area in search of sexual adventures with the Kalash women who are erroneously perceived as being promiscuous' (1994: 85). Alarming consequences are reported by a Gérard Rovillé (1988:164), who writes:

> The young girls, and preferably the unmarried, are employed as servants by businessmen or officials in Rawalpindi or Islamabad for miserable wages, and being non-Muslims they have a reputation for being loose women, at least in the big cities, and are wanted for this rather than for simple household duties. This reputation appears to have grown among the city population and is threatening to lead to forms of internal tourism oriented towards prostitution.[18]

Enjoyment of the pleasures of life and sexual liberty belong to the paradises of which the literati write about and to which many travellers are longing for (cf. the myth of the South Pacific).[19] Among the Kalasha, this image certainly intensifies their position as a religious outsider within the Pakistani society—they are becoming an indecent curiosity depicted on postcards, posters, and, since 1994, also on T-shirts sold by Islamabad's Naksh boutique.

To the inhabitants of a paradise on earth, where people live together happily, naturally, simply, and in harmony,[20] belong the shamans.[21] One should think about the boom of books published on shamanism in the field of popular anthropological and esoteric literature. The trance specialists of the Kalasha are emphasized and described in many travelogues. For the Shaman, the emotive word 'magician of the mountains' (H. Uhlig) is used; he is also called 'magic priest,' 'shaman priest,' and so on.[22]

The Discovery of Ethno-art

A feeling of uneasiness with their own culture and the search for naturalness also led painters to the Kalasha. Uwe Topper (1962, 1963, 1966), Horst Beck (1964), and Mohammad Bugi (1980 and end of the 1980s), to name a few, were inspired by the local ornamental art and wooden sculptures.[23]

Bugi (also written Boogy), a painter belonging to Lahore, has recently tried to revitalize the 'primitive' tribal art of the Kalasha.[24] Aware that many effigies were stolen by unscrupulous art dealers and eventually reached Western museums often through winding paths (though some had already been sold since the end of the 'fifties by the Kalasha themselves),[25] Bugi

encouraged carvers—like Mirzamast from the village of Brun in the Bumboret valley—to take up adze and knife again and prompted children to paint. Bugi devoted himself to the preservation and promotion of traditional Kalasha art, but not without the aspect of commercialization. In a souvenir shop near Brun (exaggeratedly called 'gallery' and situated near the Benazir Hotel) drawings of Kalasha children, wood carvings of Mirzamast, and other objects of ethno-art were sold.[26] In the meantime, one could also buy them in a tourist shop in Karachi and there were several sales exhibitions in Lahore, Karachi, and Islamabad as well. But isn't folk art here gradually going to be deformed into souvenir art? It seems more doubtful that it will really lead to a recollection of art forms, materials, and techniques, which were handed down to the Kalasha. This process ought to be rooted in the context of life and could be supported by other nativistic elements. Probably the breeding ground for a revitalization of the already atrophied art is too limited facing the massive pressure by the Muslim neighbours and the own converts, after all. It is doubtful if the Kalasha can fulfil the demands mentioned by de Kadt, who writes: 'To be authentic, arts and crafts must be rooted both in historical tradition and present-day life; true authenticity cannot be achieved by conservation alone, since that leads to stultification' (1979: 15). Keeping in mind further phenomena of folklorization, there remains the question to which cultural identity they will find their way back in—if at all. Will it be a mere cliché marked by nostalgia, an ideal model of their own culture, which was, moreover, induced from outside? Ethnic arts and crafts will only express the cultural identity of the Kalasha properly if authentic pieces of quality are produced in a limited number and do not become standardized objects adapted to the taste of the tourist. The recent change started by Mohammad Bugi and planned as a kind of aid for development seems dubious considering the new functions which are now attributed to these 'objects of art.' Not until commercialization began were traditional graffiti and soot paintings converted to the completely new material: paper.[27] Comparably even worse is an incident reported by Birgitte Sperber:

> While staying in Bomburet Mr Bugi got what he considered the brilliant idea of decorating the Bashali [menstruation house] in Anish. So he entered the area and made big colourful pictures on the outside walls, in what he considered an authentic style—including that of a woman with naked breasts. These pictures on the place the Kalasha want to be unnoticed, of course, attracted tourists and the picture of the woman confirmed the Muslim beliefs that the Kalasha women are 'easy'. The Kalasha men were upset, but could not prevent him—he had important connections, and they cannot go to the Bashali area themselves (1993: 18).

Apparently, the short-lived project of the Lahori painter has, however, hardly left any other marks among the Kalasha.[28]

Conclusion

In popular travel literature, which promotes ethnic tourism to the Kalasha, the myth of an ideal but dying out culture is portrayed. The foreigner projects his or her longing for harmony, peace, security, mystery, and for an integral life rooted in mythical origins onto the Kalasha. Among them he or she looks for a concrete paradise on earth, an Arcadia, which is not yet ruined by the rational, highly industrialized civilization of the West.[29] Contrary to the aggressive 'culture' of Europe and America the Kalasha, who are romanticized as people of antiquity, personify peaceful 'nature.' They are consequently also called 'children of nature' in some travelogues[30] and considered representatives of a childlike period in the development

of humanity which is closer to nature. Besides the longing for an ideal world and the yearning for idylls, another motive for travelling is the alleged isolation of these 'Greeks of Asia.' They are thought of as still unspoiled by negative influences from outside. 'There is no theft nor crimes of violence among them...' (Lines 1989: 43–54).

People who bewail that 'a mountain tribe dies out'[31] refer not to the demographic situation, since the Kalasha have a growing birthrate, but to the massive religious and social pressure and to economic exploitation by the neighbours which will eventually lead to the loss of this 'paradise on earth.' In each case a more effective protection of the religious minority of the Kalasha has to be demanded from the Government of Pakistan, instead of the commercialization of their traditional culture in the course of an exotic tourism, which plays its own part in the process of destruction.[32]

Acknowledgements

This text presents an updated and extended version of my article 'Die Sehnsucht nach dem irdischen Paradies: Ethnotourismus zu den Kalasha' published 1993 in *Internationales Asienforum* (24/1–2: pp. 45–56).

I would like to thank Peter Parkes and Max Klimburg for reading the article and helpful suggestions.

NOTES

1. Besides this proper ethnonym, the Khowar word Kalash (name given by the Chitrali) is mostly used in the literature.
2. Cf. Haserodt 1989: 99; Frembgen 1989: 52. The present article explicitly continues the topic of this earlier study.
3. Concerning the development of tourism in the Kalasha valleys cf. Rovillé 1988: 150, 152, 156, 158, 164; Haserodt 1989: 158, 161.
4. Fischer 1982: 50–51.
5. Cf. Rovillé 1988: 158; Lines 1989: 55; Parkes 1990: 12.
6. Cf. Gyr's statement: 'It is extremely revealing what travel-handbooks cut out, reduce, or ignore of the cultural reality' (1988: 233). Cf. Frembgen 1989, Lauterbach 1992.
7. Meiss 1958: 70-71; Maraini 1964: 243–44, 258; Rajput 1964: 3; Balneaves 1972: 79–81; Afzal Khan 1975: 68; Uhlig 1978: 79–80; Stede 1979: 36; Adamson & Shaw 1981: 173; PTDC, catalogue 'Pakistan. Northern Areas' 1981; deputy commissioner Chitral 1982: 42; Pabel 1984: 34; Buschmann 1984: 238; Indoculture Tours, catalogue 1984/85: 54; Senft 1985: 3; Studiosus Studienreisen, catalogue 1985: 232; Indoculture Tours, special programme 'Pakistan. Jeep' 1985/86: 4; Marco Polo-Reisen, catalogue 1985/86: 35; Minitrek-Expeditionen, catalogue 1985/86: 14; Ikarus Tours, catalogue 1986: 19, catalogue 1997: 97, 99; Senft & Senft 1986: 186; Lines 1989: 52; Amin et al. 1989: 95; Shaw 1989a: 345; Chughtai 1991: 77; Twigg 1992: 16; Anon. 1993: 25 ('Kafir Kalash...a pagan tribe, practising the ancient Greek rituals. Look at the Kafirs, and you'll say this is the legendary land of health and beauty'); Bokhari 1994: 35; Follath 1994: 146.

   Loude and Lièvre have already critically mentioned the alleged Greekness of the Kalash:

   > Despite 70 years of linguistic research of the Hindu Kush and recent conclusive evidence dispelling the myth of Greek origins of the Kafirs and other peoples of these high mountain ranges, that myth is still spread across the pages of the tourist brochures on Pakistan and feeds the eyecatching titles of hastily prepared reports recently devoted to the Kalash (1987: 11) Cf. in more detail: Loude 1980: 152–62. For comparison with the stereotyped Hunzukuts see Frembgen 1989: 60–61.
8. Meiss 1958: 76–77; Maraini 1964: 252–53, 257–58; Rajput 1964: 26; Balneaves 1972: 77–78, 100 ff.; Afzal Khan 1975: 76 ff.; Uhlig 1978: 82–83; Stede 1979: 40 ff.; Hauser Exkursionen, programme in detail '*Pakistan*—Nanga Parbat' 1984: 4–5, catalogue 1986/87: 21; Studiosus Studienreisen, catalogue 1984: 122, 201, catalogue 1985: 135, 232, catalogue 1992: 172; Senft 1985: 4; Indoculture Tours, special programme 'Pakistan. Jeep' 1985/86: 4–5, cf. catalogue 1984/85: 54; Minitrek-Expeditionen, catalogue 1983/84: 9,

catalogue 1985/86: 12; Senft & Senft 1986: 199–202; Lines 1988: 224–32; Lines 1989: 56; Shaw 1989a: 347 (recommendation to visit festivals); Chughtai 1991: 78 (list of all the Kalasha-festivals with detailed information); Mummunka & Hasan 1991: 36–37 (under the section 'holidays' all the festivals are recorded); Twigg 1992: 16 (recommendation to visit festivals); Gruber 1993: 6–7, 14–15; Bokhari 1994: 35 (with exact festival dates); cf. also Burgbacher 1959: 95–116 (chap. 'Durchs rätselhafte Kafiristan': the Bumboret valley as the scene for an adventure story).

9. Studiosus Studienreisen, catalogue 1984: 122, catalogue 1985: 135.
10. Compare, e.g., Balneaves 1972: 96–97; Inamullah Jan Afghani 1973: ill. opp. pp. 8, 9; Amin et al. 1989: 97; Shaw 1989b: 173.
11. Treichler 1976: 53; Adamson & Shaw 1981: 170; Rosiny 1983: 297; cf. Jettmar 1975: 327–28; Rovillé 1988: 158; Bokhari 1994: 35.
12. Compare, e.g., Hahn 1982: 37; Nasir Jamal 1989: D; Parkes 1990: 12; Lines 1992: 17. Another incident of ugly misbehaviour by tourists is reported by Maureen Lines, who writes: 'In Bumboret, according to a Western tourist, a group of young men from Lahore desecrated Kalash coffins. They then took photos of one another holding skulls beneath their arms which they later tossed away' (1992: 17).
13. Lines 1992: 17.
14. Rössner 1988: 48–50; compare, e.g., Maraini 1964: 252–53.
15. In 1984 the fee was 400 rupees for one performance (Senft & Senft 1986: 185); in 1992 it increased to 1500 rupees, in which every dancer (mostly younger girls or old women) had to be content with 10 or 20 rupees, the rest went to the male agent.
16. Meiss 1958: 77; Balneaves 1972: 102–03; Inamullah Jan Afghani 1973: 15; Gruber 1983; Pabel 1984: 31; Senft 1985: 4; Gruber 1986: 34–35; Kregel 1986; Senft & Senft 1986: 193, 202.
17. Meiss 1958: 76.
18. Cf. Bokhari 1994: 35 ('It is true that groups of people from the Punjab come to these valleys in search of women for sex. They may succeed in their attempts, but that in no way means that the Kalash people are surviving on the money they get through prostitution').
19. Cf. Rössner 1988: 36.
20. Meiss 1958: 70; Maraini 1964: 250; Rajput 1964: 26; Pabel 1984: 34; Gruber 1986: 35.
21. Rössner 1988: 37, 41.
22. Uhlig 1978: 77, 83–85 (his term 'magician of the mountains' was again and again taken over by other authors); Ikarus-Expeditionen, catalogue 1981/82: 19, catalogue 1986: 19; Gruber 1983; Minitrek-Expeditionen, catalogue 1983/84: 11, catalogue 1985/86: 14; Buschmann 1984: 239; Hauser Exkursionen, detail programme 'Pakistan—Nanga Parbat' 1984: 4; Senft 1985; Senft & Senft 1986: 183 ff., 193–96; Studienreisen Klingenstein, catalogue 1985/86: 51; Gruber 1986: 35.
23. A heartbreakingly kitschy colour postcard has been sketched by Aftab Zafar and Salwat on behalf of the Pakistan Art Institute (Karachi) depicting Kalasha girls, one of them playing hide-and-seek behind a wooden effigy.
24. Nasir Jamal 1989; Qudsia & Maher 1989; Wutt 1990: 30–31; Oreilly 1991; Sperber 1993: 18.
25. 'Die beiden allerbesten Stücke meiner Sammlung sind natürlich die zwei lebensgroßen Holzfiguren. Die eine konnte ich auf der Begräbnisstätte von Karakal und die andere in Brun erwerben. ... In beiden Fällen wurde mirdie Figur vom nächsten Verwandten des Verstorbenen zum Kauf angeboten, so daßich mich keines Friedhofraubes schuldig gemacht habe'. (Meiss 1958:76)
26. Oreilly 1991: 5.
27. With the remarkable exception of the Austrian anthropologist-cum-architect Karl Wutt, who for scientific purposes encouraged Kalasha children and adults to paint in order to study their religion and symbolism. His sensible approach has nothing to do with Bugi's rough and thoughtless 'project.'
28. Letter by Karl Wutt.
29. The ideal world of the Kalasha valleys has, however, got its drawback: some years ago a Swiss couple was murdered in Bumboret after the lady was raped. In October 1992, in the same valley, a French girl was raped. However, in both cases the culprits were obviously not Kalasha. So also in the press it is noted: 'The local Kalash, it may be mentioned, never indulge in such excesses, for they have the reputation of being a very peaceful community' (Behroz Khan 1992: 5).
30. Gruber 1983; Santiago 1985: 328.
31. Deputy commissioner Chitral 1982: 42; Gruber 1983; Nasir Jamal 1989. Cf. Lines 1989: 56 ('The Kalash, now numbering 4,000 are on the increase').
32. Maureen Lines herself laments 'Will Tourism Kill the Kalash?' (title of an article from 1991), but this has not prevented her in her new travelogue (published 1988) from introducing the chapters devoted to the Kalasha

(pp. 179–237) with the headline 'Shangri-la' and thereby evoking associations with a mythical dreamland of bliss and happiness. No doubt her book promotes tourism like all the other travelogues, articles, and films.

References

Guidebooks, Travelogues, and Reports

Adamson, Hilary, & Isobel Shaw. 1981. *A Traveller's Guide to Pakistan.* Islamabad: The Asian Study Group.

Amin, Mohamed, and Duncan Willetts, & Brian Tetley. 1989. *The Roof of the World.* Nairobi: Camerapix Publ. Internat.

Anon. 1993: A Trip beyond Time. *Humsafar* 16/6: pp. 24–25.

Balneaves, Elizabeth. 1972. *Mountains of the Murgha Zerin. Between the Hindu Khush and the Karakoram.* London.

Behroz Khan. 1992. Mystery Still Shrouds Rape of French Tourist. *The News* (22 October): pp. 5.

Bokhari, Salim. 1994. A Culture in Search of Survival. *The News* on Friday (19 August): p. 35.

Buschmann, Karl Heinz. 1984. *Pakistan. Reiseführer mit Landeskunde.* Frankfurt: Mai Verlag.

Burgbacher, Kurt. 1959. *Aka. Der Sohn des Pathanen. Eine Flucht durch das afghanische Bergland.* Bielefeld.

Chughtai, Raheel. 1991. Chitral. *Pakistan Tourist Guide* 3/1–2: pp. 77–78.

Dameyer, Christina 1989. Chitral. Pakistan's Fairyland. *Humsafar* 12/1: pp. 8–12.

Follath, Erich. 1994. *Pakistan. Land der Legenden.* In: Stern Nr. 10, Reisejournal S. 141, 145–146.

Gruber, Albert. 1983. Die Kalash im Hindukusch. Ein Bergvolk stirbt aus! Teilziel einer Trekkingtour im Karakorum und Hindukusch. *Dolomiten*, No 284 (7/8 December): p. 17.

_____, 1986. Die Kalasch. Gefährdetes Bergvolk in den Tälern des Hindukusch. *Der Bergsteiger* 2: pp. 30–35.

_____, 1993. *Solange sie noch leben. Die Berg- und Wandervölker Zentralasiens.* Vahrn.

Hahn, Regine. 1982. Zukunft für die Kalash? *Pogrom. Zeitschrift für bedrohte Völker* 88: pp. 36–37.

Hancock, G. 1983. *The Beauty of Pakistan.* Nairobi.

Kregel, Bernd. 1986. Geheimnis am Ende der Welt. Auf dem Karakorum Highway durch Nordpakistan. *General-Anzeiger* (24/25 May): Bonn, p. XXII.

Lines, M. P. 1988. *Beyond the North-West Frontier. Travels in the Hindu Kush and Karakorams.* Somerset: The Oxford Illustrated Press.

_____, 1989. Victims of Progress. *The Herald* (20/6 Jun.): pp. 51–56.

_____, 1991. Letter from Chitral. Will Tourism Kill the Kalash? *The Muslim* (22 Nov.).

_____, 1992. When the Tourists Come Marching In. *The Friday Times*, (15/21 Oct.): p. 17.

_____, 1994. Disappearing World. *The Herald* (25/2 Feb.): pp. 85–89.

Maraini, F. 1964. *Where Four Worlds Meet. Hindu Kush 1959.* London.

H. Meiss, von. 1958. Bei den Kafirs im Hindu Kush. *Atlantis* 30/2: pp. 67–77.

Mummunka, Akhtar, & Masood Hasan. 1991. *Pakistan Travel Tips.* Lahore: Sang-e Meel Publications).

Nasir Jamal. 1989. The Kalash—On Verge of Extinction. *The Pakistan Times*—Midweek (29 Aug.): A, D.

Oreilly, Chullaine. 1991. *The Renaissance of a Tribal Art.* Leaflet. Karachi: Goethe-Institute.

Pabel, H. 1984. Pakistan. Was den Frauen die Last leichtmacht. *Hör zu* 50: pp. 30–31, 34, 36.

Qudsia & Maher, 1989: *In Quest of Preserving Kalash.* In: The Nation - Midweek, p. I, IV (27-9-1989).

Quentric, Martine. 1973. The Kafir Kalash. *Focus on Pakistan* 3/1: pp. 30–38.

Rajput, A.B. 1964. Le monde perdu des Kalash. *Objets et Mondes* 4/1: pp. 3–28.

Rosiny, Tonny. 1983. *Pakistan. Drei Hochkulturen am Indus: Harappa—Gandhara—Die Moguln.* Köln: DuMont-Buchverlag.

Santiago, J.R. 1985. *Pakistan.* Hattorf: Schettler Travel Publications.

Senft, Willi. 1985. Kalash—'Die Zauberer der Berge'. Bei den Kafiren Nordpakistans. *Hauser-Mitteilungen* 4/2: pp. 3–4.

Senft, Hilde, & Willi Senft. 1986. *Hunza. Bergvolk an der Seidenstraße.* Graz L. Stocker Verlag.

Shaw, Isobel. 1989a. *Pakistan Handbook.* Hong Kong: The Guidebook Company.

_____, 1989b. *Collins Illustrated Guide to Pakistan.* London: Collins.

Stede, Clark. 1979. Kalashs. Les Grecs d'Asie. *Atlas* 157/7: pp. 35–44.

Stockbower, Lauren. 1982. Chaomos. The Return of Balimaiyan. *Humsafar* 3/5: pp. 38–43.

Swift, Hugh. 1990. *Trekking in Pakistan and India.* London: Hodder and Stoughton.

Treichler, R. 1976. In den Bazaren des Wilden Ostens. Von Opiumhändlern bei den Pathanen zu den Geheimnissen der Hunzawals. *Die Zeit* 44 (22 Oct.): pp. 53–54.

Twigg, Christopher. 1992. Chitral: Shangri-la above the Clouds. *Humsafar* 15/5: pp. 14–16.

Uhlig, H. 1978. *Am Thron der Götter. Abenteuerliche Reisen im Hindukusch und Himalaya.* München: C. Bertelsmann Verlag.

Scientific Literature

Ahmed, Akbar S. 1986. The Islamization of the Kalash Kafirs. In *Pakistan Society. Islam, Ethnicity and Leadership in South Asia*, pp. 23–28. Karachi: Oxford University Press.

Afzal Khan, Mohammad. 1975. *Chitral and Kafiristan.* Peshawar.

Alauddin. 1992. *Kalash. The Paradise Lost.* Lahore: Progressive Publications.

de Kadt, E., ed. 1979. *Tourism. Passport to Development?* New York: Oxford University Press.

Deputy commissioner Chitral. 1982. Die Kalash-Kafiren in Nord-Pakistan. Die dringende Notwendigkeit, einem bedrohten Volk zu helfen. Bericht eines Distriktkommissars. *Pogrom* 92: pp. 42–44.

Fischer, Hans. 1982. Ethnologie und Tourismusforschung. *Mitteilungen aus dem Museum für Völkerkunde Hamburg* NS 12: pp. 37–54.

Frembgen, J. W. 1989. Hunza und Shangri-la. Ein Bergvolk in der Tourismuswerbung. *Münchner Beiträge zur Völkerkunde* 2: pp. 51–68.

Gyr, Ueli. 1988. Touristenkultur und Reisealltag. Volkskundlicher Nachholbedarf in der Tourismusforschung. *Zeitschrift für Volkskunde* 84: pp. 224–239.

Haserodt, K. 1989. Chitral (Pakistanischer Hindukusch). Strukturen, Wandel und Probleme eines Lebensraumes im Hochgebirge zwischen Gletschern und Wüste. In ed. K. *Hochgebirgsräumem Nordpakistans im Hindu Kush, Karakorum und Westhimalaya*, Haserodt, pp. 43–180. Beiträge and Mat erialien zur Regionalen Geographic, 2 Berlin: TU Berlin.

Horedt, K. 1990. Ein Bildhauer aus Ägypten als Begleiter von Alexander d. Gr. am Hindukusch. *Mitteilungen der Berliner Gesellschaft für Anthropologie, Ethnologie und Urgeschichte* 11: p. 61.

———, 1991. Makedonen am Hindukusch. *Mitteilungen der Berliner Gesellschaft für Anthropologie, Ethnologie und Urgeschichte* 12: pp. 85–86.

Inamullah Jan Afghani. 1973. *The Kalash Society of Chitral at a Glance.* Peshawar.

Jettmar, Karl. 1975. *Die Religionen des Hindukusch.* Stuttgart: Verlag W. Kohlhammer.

Lauterbach, Burkhart. 1992. 'Von den Einwohnern'. Alltagsdarstellungen im Spiegel des Reiseführers. *Zeitschrift für Volkskunde* 88/1: pp. 49–66.

Loude, J.-Y. 1980. *Kalash. Les derniers 'infidèles' de l'Hindu-Kush.* Paris: Berger-Levrault.

Loude, J.-Y. & V. Lièvre. 1987. *Kalash Solstice.* Islamabad: Lok Virsa.

Parkes, P. 1990. Kalasha Rites of Spring. Backstage of a 'Disappearing World' Film. *Anthropology Today* 6/5: pp. 11–13.

Rössner, Michael. 1988. *Auf der Suche nach dem verlorenen Paradies. Zum mythischen Bewußtsein in der Literatur des 20. Jahrhundert.* Frankfurt: Athenäum Verlag.

Rovillé, G. 1988. Ethnic Minorities and the Development of Tourism in the Valleys of North Pakistan. In *Tourism: Manufacturing the Exotic*, ed. P. Rossel, pp. 147–76. Copenhagen: International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs.

Sperber, B. G. 1993. Kalasha Development Problems. Paper presented at the Conference of European Kalasha Researchers, Aarhus University, Denmark, 25–27 Mar.

Smith, V. L. 1978. Introduction. In *Hosts and Guests. The Anthropology of Tourism*, ed. V.L. Smith, pp. 1–14. Oxford.

Wutt, K. 1990. Kalash Zeichnungen. In *Nuristan. Gläubige und Kafiren im Hindukusch (Afghanistan)*, pp. 29–32. Wien: Museum für Völkerkunde.